President Nakajo called the meeting to order at 4:05 PM.

1. **ROLL CALL**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Commission President</td>
<td>Stephen Nakajo</td>
<td>Present</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commission Vice President</td>
<td>Andrea Evans</td>
<td>Present</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commissioner</td>
<td>Michael Hardeman</td>
<td>Present</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commissioner</td>
<td>Francee Covington</td>
<td>Present</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commissioner</td>
<td>Ken Cleaveland</td>
<td>Present</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chief of Department</td>
<td>Joanne Hayes-White</td>
<td>Present</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mark Gonzales</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Raymond Guzman</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deputy Chief – Operations</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ADC s</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ken Lombardi</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Raemona Williams</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Shane Francisco</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Support Services</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Division of Training</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Home Land Security</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assistant Chiefs</td>
<td>Kevin Smith</td>
<td>Division 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Matthew McNaughton</td>
<td>Division 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staff</td>
<td>Mark Corso</td>
<td>CFO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Clement Yeh</td>
<td>EMS Medical Director</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Jesusa Bushong</td>
<td>Department Personnel Officer</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. **PUBLIC COMMENT**

   Michael Petrelis, Sunshine advocate, urged the Department to immediately move the meetings to City Hall and televise their meetings. He accused the Commission of engaging in a form of censorship. He said that if the command staff is not willing to take Muni to City Hall, use a bit of the budget to install cameras or get a devise to live stream the meetings.

   Bonnie Chung, neighbor of Station 33, stated her concern of not having an ALS at Station 33 and described the demographics of the entire neighborhood.

   Russell Roby, San Francisco firefighter for 20 years, and resident of Bernal Heights spoke of his concerns on the EMS issues and Station 33 not having an ALS unit. He provided background and statistics to support his concerns.

   Mary Harris, President of OMI Neighbors in Action, started by stating she has total confidence in the Fire Chief. She continued on with her concerns at Station 33 and agreed with what Bonnie Chung said. She added that she thinks it’s imperative that the Fire Department prevail upon the Mayor and the BOS to give the Department the resources that it needs to make sure that the seniors in her neighborhood are covered with proper ALS units and that they are safe.
Shon Buford, San Francisco Firefighter and representative of Local 798 stated his support of all ALS engines and he would like to see the Department move towards the direction that all stations have the medical professional care that the City deserves.

3. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES [Discussion and possible action]
Discussion and possible action to approve meeting minutes


Commissioner Hardeman Moved to approve the Minutes. Commissioner Cleaveland Seconded. Motion to Adopt Minutes of Meeting on September 25, 2014 was unanimous.

Public Comment: Michael Petrelis expressed his disappointment that draft minutes are not printed and available for the public to view and mentioned after looking over the minutes posted on line, there are a number of meetings where there is no public comment and once again suggested getting on Channel 26, and he feels that people watching these commission meetings on TV are going to provide a robust number of members of the public speaking out about the concerns regarding the Fire Department.

4. RESOLUTION 2014-03 [Discussion and possible action]
Discussion and possible action to approve Resolution 2014-03, recommending that the Board of Supervisors authorize the San Francisco Fire Department to accept and expend the FY 2013 FEMA Assistance to Firefighters Grant in the amount of $1,485,014 to replace exhaust extractors in various fire houses

Mark Corso, CFO of the Department presented Resolution 2014-03 for the Commission’s consideration and approval. A brief discussion with questions and answers ensued and the Commission approved the Resolution.

Commissioner Covington Moved to approve Resolution 2014-03. Commissioner Cleaveland Seconded. Motion to approve Resolution 2014-03 was unanimous.

5. UPDATE AND PROGRESS REPORT PERTAINING TO EMS WORKGROUP MEETINGS
Discussion and progress report made during EMS workgroup meetings

Chief Hayes-White invited Dr. Yeh and Chief Gonzales to come up and present on the progress of the EMS workgroup meetings. Before she got started on the workgroup progress report, she wanted to respond to some of the public comments that were presented earlier pertaining to the ALS and BLS issues and wanted to explain the rationale for taking the ALS engine from Station 33. Deputy Chief Gonzales explained the strategic methods that were put in to play to avoid mandatory overtime and make sure ALS engines were strategically placed so they can respond to emergencies in the required amount of time to keep us in the 90 percent range. Ideally, they would like to have an ALS throughout the city, although there is a cost associated with it to have all ALS engine companies.

Chief Hayes-White proceeded with the EMS workgroup progress report. She stated that the workgroup has been meeting since the beginning of September and they have had six or seven meetings. She went on to say that the EMS Division is housed at 1415 and they never intended for that to be a permanent site. They have been working with Chief Lombardi, who is working with the City’s Real Estate Division, Chief Myers, Chief Gonzales, Dr. Yeh and Commissioner Cleaveland looking at not just immediate solutions but for a long term housing
site for the EMS Division. They are looking at different ways to get the members back in service quicker. She added that the 35 new EMT’s that hit the street on August 30th has improved response times but it’s not dropping as quickly as they should. Chief Hayes-White believes they all have a common goal of fixing the problem. She added that they have considered modifying the schedules of Station 49 members, hiring per diem EMT’s and really looking at an overall capacity issue as they see the call volume grow and how to sustain it. She added that there is going to be an H-3 Level 1 EMT test administered. Chief Hayes-White stated that discussions surrounding the original budget request for 42 new EMT’s and only getting 16 is a factor that she thinks the members of the workgroup agrees that the Department would be doing much better had the original request been approved at the executive and legislative branches of government. She stated they are addressing that and are looking at best practices throughout the nation regarding an evolving EMS system. She added that they will collaborate with the private partners, who have put more dedicated ambulances into the system, which has also shown additional improvement.

Dr. Yeh added that there are two other processes that are going on simultaneously. There’s a subcommittee on data that’s being run in conjunction with members of the controller’s office, DEM, DC and the Department, at looking to actually get a cohesive data set to describe the performance. Second, there’s also a 911 providers’ group that is looking at both the operations and the private partners with respect to what the work schedules are and looking at what staffing those hours are from command analysis and hopefully solidifying some of the rules of operations that are going to actually help us have a better grasp of what our own operation needs are.

Commissioner Cleaveland stated that being a part of the working group has been a real learning experience. He added that although it can be at times frustrating because government works very slowly when they’re trying to create something back into working order very quickly. He added that there’s a lot they are doing currently and he’s encouraged by it, it’s just not fast enough. He stated that the Chief needs to sit down with the Union and iron out some of the issues involving sick leave management and other inefficiencies that are in the system so the Fire Department, particularly the EMS system, can run more efficiently. He thinks working collaboratively can get these things done. He also thought a lot of logistics can be worked on such as having someone from the Department of Public Health be situated at certain addresses that place 911 calls for sometimes non-emergency situations. He thinks it would reduce the demand on the services.

Vice President Evans stated that she is not as optimistic about the workgroup as she was a couple of weeks ago. She stated that she is incredibly frustrated and disheartened that a lot of the attention has been placed on members at Station 49, particularly with this issue of sick time abuse and she thinks it’s not the right message to send at this time and she thinks it is irresponsible that that message is being put out there. She added that everyone at the table knows that the Department needs more personnel and they’re not willing to talk about bringing in a new class as part of the short-term solution. She continued that if we have an opportunity to redesign an EMS system that is more efficient and world class the way we want it to be, we should take the time to do that.

Commissioner Cleaveland added that he thought a lot of progress can be made without adding more paramedics and that the Department can get more out of what they have. He expressed his concern about getting on track for the 2015 Health Bond to get the funding to relocate Station 49. Chief Lombardi acknowledged that the Department is on track to be on that bond.
Chief Lombardi went into detail about the search for property to relocate Station 49 and all the options that they are looking into.

Commissioner Covington thanked her fellow commissioners for their feedback on the work group meetings and stated when we talk about these very important issues in soft tones, often times we’re not heard. She believes the push for an additional class is essential and she feels that it’s not going to be viewed by most people as a collaborative effort without that class and that solutions would fall into place if there were more paramedics.

Chief Hayes-White stated that she felt confident that they will get on the bond because they have a plan in place. She went on to explain the reasoning behind the bond and the other Departments that are relying on the health bond and the logistics of having a central facility as well as a satellite facility and she touched on dynamic deployment.

President Nakajo commented that these discussions would not be taking place if it wasn’t for the workgroup and stated his appreciation to all the workgroup players as well as the commissioners that are a part of it because he knows it’s a lot of time and energy that is devoted to these meetings.

Public Comment:

Shon Buford of Local 798 thanked the Commissioners and administration for the opportunity to speak and gave clarification on the issue raised of Tom O’Connor of 798 agreeing to 27 ALS engines. He stated the reason the Union agreed to this was because the members were being required to work mandatory overtime on a regular basis and it was very difficult on their families. So in order to alleviate the mandatory overtime, they agreed for a temporary reduction to 27 ALS engines. He also mentioned that what was not discussed, was that prior to the reduction, the Union advocated for more H-3 Level 3’s be hired. He added that it is the Union’s position that they do not want to remove them back from the class to the ambulance because there is a reduction on the engines, you can’t take one problem and fill it with another problem. He said that as for Station 49, they support moving forward with the bond. He touched on the budget issues, shortage of staffing levels, sick time and response times.

Michael Petrelis spoke of his disappointment of not having access to the preliminary reports as well as other pieces of information used during the meeting and that better engagement from the commission is needed. He mentioned that he is hard of hearing and the setup of the meeting room makes it hard to hear the presentation and microphones should be placed at the table. He reiterated the need to air meetings on Channel 26 and he asked that every commissioner put the microphone closer to their mouths.

6 CHIEF OF DEPARTMENT’S REPORT [Discussion]
REPORT FROM CHIEF OF DEPARTMENT

Report on current issues, activities and events within the Department, including Fiscal Year 2014-2015 budget

Chief Hayes-White reported on the time line from October 9th through the present. She started with the budget, which just completed the first quarter of this fiscal year and that the Department is on track according to CFO Mark Corso. She shared news that she was able to fill the position of the Assistant Deputy Chief of Homeland Security and introduced Assistant Deputy Chief Shane Francisco. Chief Francisco gave a brief introduction of his personal and work history background and thanked everyone.
Chief Hayes-White explained the Department’s comprehensive Ebola plan and that they will be getting out an excellent policy today or tomorrow and they have worked collaboratively with the Department of Public Health on it. She touched upon the emergency declaration that put station 48 on a faster track with the Department of Public Works. She mentioned all the happenings going on in the City including the commissioning of the USS America, Fleet Week, the Presidential arrivals, the 25th anniversary of the Loma Prieta earthquake and the NERT drill. She acknowledged the great work of the men and women in the Department that are getting work done under circumstances that are challenging, particularly related to EMS.

Chief Hayes-White talked about the employee group meetings and thanked the Commissioners who attended to talk about concerns raised by some of the members of the employee groups, and where she conveyed to them her continued commitment to move the Department forward and get us on track, particularly that the economy is recovering and relayed to them, she thinks they can do a lot more together versus apart. Chief Hayes-White described the collaborative work being done through the SF Firefighters Cancer Prevention Foundation and the breast cancer study in women firefighters.

Chief Hayes-White provided an update on her recent trip to Arizona to attend the Southwest Community Preparedness Conference and that it was a “Lessons Learned Conference”. She stated that is was a very valuable conference.

Chief Hayes-White also mentioned that in the interest of continuing open communication she will be hosting town hall type forums at the Division of Training from 9:00 to 10:30 on the 28th -30th for all members to attend.

Commissioner Cleaveland asked about the expense to the Department when unexpected events come up such as the President and Vice President visits and .the Giants going to post season. He suggested recommending the Department put some kind of contingency amount for these types of events. Mark Corso answered that the Department absorbs most of the cost for these short-term events. They take into account when presenting the budget, scenarios of these sorts.

Commissioner Cleaveland asked for an update on any discussions that have occurred since Supervisor Wiener’s presentation last week. Chief Wong explained the discussions and meetings that have taken place and the City agencies that have been working on the subdivision regulations are a united front, with support from Vision Zero and she is hoping to have consensus with Supervisor Wiener.

REPORT FROM ADMINISTRATION
Report on the Administrative Divisions, Fleet and Facility status, Finance and Support Services within the Department and possible discussion pertaining to the Portable Water Supply System

Chief Guzman reported on the Month of October. He started with Support Services and reported that three out of six Focus Scope packages have been completed with the ESER 10 money. He stated that Station 36 and Station 4 remain on schedule to be completed on a November/December timeframe. He added that Station 16 should be started by April 2015, and Station 5 to follow. He confirmed that all 10 of the new engines have been delivered. He anticipates in the next few weeks the delivery of Ford Explorers Battalion Buggies for Battalion 4, 6, 7, and 8. He confirmed that the 117th recruit academy is in their 9th of a 17-week academy.

Chief Hayes-White stated it was brought to her attention that members of the Department found it difficult to find Agendas and Minutes on the website, so she had the Department’s IT coordinator, Jesus Mora linked them to the Departments intranet through AO Reports.

Commissioner Cleaveland thanked Chief Guzman for setting up the tour on the Fire Boat. He inquired about tracking maintenance on facilities and equipment. Mark Corso responded that they are actually trying to fill a vacant position for a civilian maintenance employee.
Commissioner Cleaveland stated that the Commission meetings should be televised to be more reachable to citizens in San Francisco. Chief Hayes-White answered that if it is the will of the Commission to have the meetings televised, it would be something that would need to be put in the budget.

Commissioner Hardeman stated that a detailed report was done a while back on moving the meetings to City Hall and they should take at look it. It was justified that the Command Staff needed to be in this building (HQ) in case of an emergency, to be near the command center. He went on to congratulate Chief Francisco. He commented on how busy the Chief had been and that he enjoyed reading the Chronicle Opinion on the good work of the Chief.

Vice President Evans thanked the Chief for supporting the breast cancer study and hopes they get some useful information that could help save lives of members and of others. Further discussions pertaining to Supervisor Wiener’s proposed legislation ensued and Chief Lombardi explained the ongoing discussions pertaining to the legislation as well as discussion pertaining to AB 2327 regarding GEMT funding and Mark Corso explained the process of that Assembly Bill and if it passes the Department would be getting about $2,000,000.00 a year.

Public Comment:

Michael Petrelis shared his disappointment on Agenda Item 9 being held in closed session. He stated that he believes that there has been something of a pitchfork for days, out to get the Chief and she has faced trial by fire and if these meetings were broadcast in full public view, the public and Department would benefit. He added that there needs to be more transparency regarding the Chief’s performance.

7. AGENDA FOR NEXT FIRE COMMISSION MEETING [Discussion]
Discussion regarding agenda for the November 13, 2014 regular meeting.

- Public Employee Performance Evaluation (Closed Session)

8. PRESENTATION BY DEPARTMENT OF HUMAN RESOURCES PERTAINING TO HOW TO CONDUCT PUBLIC EMPLOYEE PERFORMANCE EVALUATION
Presentation and discussion on how to conduct public employee performance evaluation

Donna Kotake, Workforce Development Director of the Department of Human Resources, gave a PowerPoint presentation of an overview as to what the City’s performance planning and appraisal process is. (The PowerPoint presentation can be obtained from the Commission Secretary at (415) 558-3451).

9. CLOSED SESSION: PUBLIC EMPLOYEE PERFORMANCE EVALUATION [Discussion]

Also Present: Deputy City Attorney Elizabeth Salveson
Commission Secretary, Maureen Conefrey

1) Public comment on all matters pertaining to this agenda item.
2) Vote on decision whether to go into closed session.

President Nakajo called for public comment. No member of the public came forward and President Nakajo closed public comment.

President Nakajo called for a motion to hold Item 11 in Closed Session. Commissioner Covington so Moved. Vice President Evans Seconded and the motion was unanimously approved.

Closed session commenced at 6:39 p.m.
A. Joanne Hayes-White, Chief of the Fire Department
Pursuant to Admin. Code section 67.10(b); Govt. Code section 54957(b), Govt. Code section 54957.1(a)(5), the Commission may hold a closed session to discuss the evaluation of the Chief (Discussion).

B. Vote on whether to disclose discussions if held in Closed Session per Administrative Code §67.12(a).

Commissioner Covington excused herself at 7:21 p.m.

Vice President Evans moved to not disclose discussions held in Closed Session. Commissioner Cleaveland seconded. The motion was unanimously approved by the Commissioners present 4-0. (Nakajo, Evans, Hardeman, Cleaveland).

The Commission reconvened in Open Session to report action taken at 7:55 p.m.

President Nakajo called for a vote on the Motion to communicate to the Chief to prepare a document outlining her accomplishments, strengths and weakness and priorities for operational fiscal year by November 20, 2014.

Commissioner Cleaveland so Moved. Vice President Evans Seconded. The motion was unanimously approved by the Commissioners present 4-0. (Nakajo, Evans, Hardeman, Cleaveland)

10. ADJOURNMENT

President Nakajo adjourned the meeting in memory of Frank Lombardi and Alameda Chief Bill McCammon at approximately 8:02 PM.