

SAN FRANCISCO FIRE COMMISSION

**FIRE COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING  
MINUTES**

---

**Wednesday, January 10, 2018 – 9:00 a.m. – 12:00 p.m.  
City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 400, San Francisco, California, 94102**

---

The Video can be viewed by clicking this link:

[http://sanfrancisco.granicus.com/MediaPlayer.php?view\\_id=180&clip\\_id=29398](http://sanfrancisco.granicus.com/MediaPlayer.php?view_id=180&clip_id=29398)

President Cleaveland called the meeting to order at 9:02 a.m.

**1. ROLL CALL**

|                           |                               |         |
|---------------------------|-------------------------------|---------|
| Commission President      | Ken Cleaveland                | Present |
| Commission Vice President | Stephen Nakajo                | Present |
| Commissioner              | Michael Hardeman              | Present |
| Commissioner              | Francee Covington             | Present |
| Commissioner              | Joe Alioto Veronese           | Present |
| Chief of Department       | Joanne Hayes-White            | Present |
| Mark Gonzales             | Deputy Chief – Operations     |         |
| Jeanine Nicholson         | Deputy Chief --Administration |         |
| Dan De Cossio             | Bureau of Fire Prevention     |         |
| Andy Zanoft               | EMS                           |         |
| Tony Rivera               | Support Services              |         |
| Khai Ali                  | Airport Division              |         |
| Jeff Columbini            | Division of Training          |         |
| Assistant Chiefs          |                               |         |
| Kevin Burke               | Division 2                    |         |
| Bill Storti               | Division 3                    |         |
| Staff                     |                               |         |
| Mark Corso                | Deputy Director of Finance    |         |
| Olivia Scanlon            | Communications and Outreach   |         |

**3. PUBLIC COMMENT**

James Delessandro, an author of 1906, the novel about the San Francisco earthquake and fire spoke about the importance of the supplemental water supply system which saved the City in the 1989 Loma Prieta. He gave an informational briefing on the history of the water supply system. He stated that the system has not been expanded to vulnerable neighborhoods and the AWSS and PWSS systems are indispensable to the survival of the City.

Tracy Thompson, a concerned citizen also spoke about the importance of maintaining and expanding the AWSS and PWSS systems and has read recent articles regarding a lack of a

system to fight a fire storm in the inner Sunset, outer Sunset, and Richmond District areas and she suggested that this issue get addressed and put in place immediately.

**4. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES [Discussion and possible action]**

Discussion and possible action to approve meeting minutes.

- Minutes from Regular Meeting on December 13, 2017.

Commissioner Hardeman Moved to approve the above meeting Minutes. Commissioner Alioto-Veronese Seconded. Motion to approve above Minutes was unanimous.

There was no public comment.

**4. REPORT ON FY 2018-2019 CAPITAL AND INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY BUDGET REQUESTS [Discussion and possible action]**

Report from the Department's Deputy Director of Finance and Planning on the Department's 2018-2019 Capital and Information Technology (IT) budget requests.

Mark Corso, Director of Finance and Planning for the Department presented the attached slideshow outlining the capital and IT budgets that will be submitted to the Board of Supervisors Capital Planning Committee and Committee on Information Technology, where they will develop various funding scenarios, levels of funding and the corresponding projects that would be funded under those scenarios. [http://sf-fire.org/sites/default/files/COMMISSION/Fire%20Commission%20Support%20Documents%202015/budget\\_2.pdf](http://sf-fire.org/sites/default/files/COMMISSION/Fire%20Commission%20Support%20Documents%202015/budget_2.pdf). He explained in detail how the work is progressing from the current ESER funds and what projects are in the works and what projects are not covered by the ESER funds. He talked about the Department of Technology infrastructure updates, server virtualization, Wi-Fi at Department Facilities and things of that sort. He talked about the two pilot ambulance that are being tested in the field currently as well as the receipt of five new command vehicles and fire prevention vehicles.

Commissioner Veronese thanked Mr. Corso for his presentation and asked for an explanation on why he was submitting individual separate budget requests. Mr. Corso responded that they are separate as they each get vetted through separate committees under the Board of Supervisors. He also explained that in regards to finding a new training facility, they are looking at what the Division of Training's needs for the Department are and that they are working very closely with the DPW and the Department of Real Estate as well as the Mayor's office. Commissioner Veronese asked about the Chief's residence and if was considered an historical structure. Mr. Corso answered that it was donated many years about and CHW gave a brief historical background on the Chief's residence. She mentioned that it's located at 870 Bush and was occupied by all of her predecessors as they did not reside in the City and it's important to have your fire chief residing in the city because it's a 24/7 responsibility. She added that it does need some additional upgrades and that they do use it once in a while for offsite meetings and the property is owned and maintained by the Department.

Commissioner Hardeman thanked Mr. Corso for his report and graphics. He asked in regards to the drone allocation, what the \$150,000.00 buys the department. Mr. Corso responded that it is an estimate for the budget and theoretically cover equipment, hardware and well as training, licensing and certification that would be required. The discussed the new Sprinter model of the pilot ambulances and Chief Zanoft described them in detail. Chief Zanoft added that they are open to suggestions and comments to make the vehicles the best vehicles for the City as well as the members who must work in them through their shifts.

Vice President Nakajo thanked Mr. Corso for his report and mentioned how he appreciates the submittal in terms of capital, fleet and IT budget request because contains a lot of information and he can see a lot of work has gone into it to come to the final numbers. Mr. Corso explained why the budgets are broken down in categories to present at committee levels but that they all end up as one budget that Board of Supervisors will vote on. They discussed the breakdown of the ESER fund projects and who the funds are allocated. They also discussed the 2009 fleet plan that the Commission approved an updated resolution to have a consistent fleet replacement. Vice President Nakajo mentioned that he thinks it's appropriate to ask for upgrades and repairs on the historical Fire Chief's residence. He also stated that it was his understanding that the antique apparatus are the responsibility of the Guardians of the City but that if we can request funding from the budget to shelter them, the Department should do that but he thinks they need an overall strategy or plan of how they can be sheltered.

Commissioner Covington suggested that Chief Zanoft bring an old and new ambulance to City Hall before the next evening meeting to give the Commissioners a chance to view them and get an orientation as to what the differences are. Chief Zanoft responded that he could accommodate that request as well as invited all of them to station 49 anytime to see the equipment and vehicles. Commissioner Covington confirmed that over the past four years, with the infusion of funding, they have replaced over half of the ambulance fleet. Mr. Corso also confirmed that the new model they are testing cost is relatively less expensive than the current units that they have, so they could obviously purchase more. Commissioner Covington was concerned at how they Department was going to stay on top of cutting edge technology. Mr. Corso responded that IT is a general fund category, and whether it comes out of the Department's budget or the City-wide budget depends on what the item is. He gave examples such as replacing computers throughout the Department, there was a city-wide refresh program that helps identify the older computers and helps purchase new ones and the departments can then use that pricing to buy additional units as needed, which is an annual program. He touched on other examples as well as stating that some of the grant submittals surround technology.

President Cleaveland asked Mr. Corso regarding the capital budget if there was money requested for the extension of the AWSS or the PWSS. Mr. Corso stated that those systems do not fall under the Capitol Budget and technically, the AWSS transfer function, at least from the budgeting perspective, has moved to the PUC and as far as the PWSS that is not listed under Capital because it is part of the overall equipment and budget proposal and is allocated for PWSS equipment. President Cleaveland also recommended that DPW have designated people assigned to the Fire Department's facilities for needed services because he thinks that people that are already familiar with the facilities can go in and get the work done more quickly. Mr. Corso explained that they do not have specific individuals assigned, it's a pool of DPW employees that get assigned out as needed to do facility work and he added that unfortunately, the department has a lot of issues, so there are a lot of DPW employees that are familiar with the facilities.

Commissioner Covington Moved to approve the budget as submitted. Commissioner Hardeman seconded. The motion was unanimously approved.

## **5. CHIEF OF DEPARTMENT'S REPORT *[Discussion]*** **REPORT FROM CHIEF OF DEPARTMENT**

Report on current issues, activities and events within the Department since the Fire Commission meeting on December 13, 2017, including budget, academies, special events, communications and outreach to other government agencies and the public.

Chief Hayes-White reported on events since the last meeting on December 13, 2017. CHW wished everyone a happy new year and congratulated President Cleaveland on his recent retirement and his birthday. She introduced Deputy Chief of Administration, Jeanine

Nicholson. Chief Nicholson thanked CHW and announced that he was honored and humbled to be able to service in the position. She thanked Chief Gonzales for helping her ease the transition as well as Chiefs' Columbini and Rivera. CHW continued by touching on the Budget, which is midway through the fiscal year and on track in terms of revenues and expenditures. With regards to academies, she mentioned that the 123 class is in its 16<sup>th</sup> week with 47 recruits and graduation will be on Thursday February 8, 2018 at Archbishop Riordan High School at 6:00 p.m. Regarding the 124<sup>th</sup> academy, which is scheduled to start on March 26, 2018 is anticipated to have 54 members, 42 off the NTN H-2 list, and 12 will be coming from Station 49 into the academy two weeks after the start date. She acknowledged Chief Columbini, Chief Zanoloff, the physician's office and the HR staff and stated they are very busy preparing for the upcoming classes, which includes the H-2 academy and H-3 Level 1 EMT class. She gave a recap of events she participated in over the reporting period which included three different toy program events, a memorial at City Hall for Mayor Lee, a labor management meeting with Local 798, policy group workshop with department heads to discussed emergency preparedness especially during an earthquake, Little Sisters of the Poor annual New Year's Eve event, a pre MOU negotiation meeting and a Vision Zero press conference. She also mentioned that VPN attended the first meeting of the Budget Committee where Mark Corso gave the budget instructions which calls for a 2.5 % reduction in this fiscal year and next fiscal and they discussed the prioritization list. She asked President Cleaveland to adjourn the meeting in memory of two retired members that passed away since the last commission meeting, Chief's Aid Al Fiorese and Battalion Chief Bill Correll.

Commissioner Veronese welcomed and congratulated Chief Nicholson to her new position.

Commissioner Covington also welcomed Chief Nicholson and stated it's been a pleasure interacting with her when she was in the field. She asked CHW to give an update on the kinds of things she feels need to be addressed in the Chief's residence. CHW explained that it is an older residence and is in need of electrical and plumbing updates as well as aesthetic work for the neighbors, including a full exterior paint job. She added that while the Department does maintain the building, she would say down the line it would need some major renovation. Commissioner Covington announced that it is very important that the official residence of the chief of the Fire Department is brought up to snuff.

There was no public comment.

#### REPORT FROM OPERATIONS

Report on overall field operations, including greater alarm fires, Emergency Medical Services, Bureau of Fire Prevention & Investigation, and Airport Division.

There was no public comment.

#### **6. FIRE COMMISSION ANNUAL STATEMENT OF PURPOSE 2018 [Discussion and possible action]**

Discussion and possible action to adopt the 2018 Annual Statement of Purpose.

There was no public comment.

#### **8 COMMISSION REPORT [Discussion]**

Report on Commission activities since last meeting of November 8, 2017

Commissioner Covington reminisced about her last visit with the Mayor before he passed. She was at a small business pop up at City Hall and she had a nice conversation with him and a chuckle. She mentioned how much he supported the department and that he was a delight to be

around and she will miss him tremendously just as our civic father, and as someone who held the department in such high esteem.

Commissioner Hardeman also mentioned what ferocious loyalty Mayor Lee had. He reminisced on conversations he had over the years with Mayor Lee and he is grateful to have had his friendship over the years.

Commissioner Veronese also reminisced about his recent conversations with Mayor Lee and how he was appointed by him to be on the Fire Commission and the best way to honor Mayor Lee is to honor him in the task that you complete in your service to the City.

There was no public comment.

**10. AGENDA FOR NEXT FIRE COMMISSION MEETING [Discussion]**

Discussion regarding agenda for the January 24, 2018 regular meeting.

- Early Warning System
- Chief's evaluation
- Budget Update - Equipment
- Strategic Plan
- Dive/Rescue team update
- Election of Officers
- NERT update
- ADF update (2/14/18)
- Draft Drone policy
- Grant writer
- Stress Unit
- Expanding EMS-6
- Commission Level Awards
- Annualizing meritorious awards
- Recognize members who have broken barriers
- Tracking quick response vehicles

There was no public comment.

**10. POSSIBLE CLOSED SESSION REGARDING EXISTING LITIGATION AND PERSONNEL MATTERS,**

*President Cleaveland called for public comment. There was no public comment.*

**a. VOTE ON WHETHER TO CONDUCT ITEMS 10(b) (c) and (d) IN CLOSED SESSION [Action]**

The Commission may hear Item 10(b) regarding existing litigation in closed session if it votes to invoke the attorney-client privilege (Government Code § 54956.9; Administrative Code § 67.10(d)). The Commission may hear Items 10(c) and (d) regarding personnel matters in closed session pursuant to Government Code Section 54957(b) and Administrative Code Section 67.10(b).

*Commissioner Covington made a motion to conduct item 10(b), (c) and (d) in Closed Session. Commissioner Hardeman seconded, and the motion was unanimously approved. (5-0; Cleaveland, Nakajo, Hardeman, Covington, Veronese)*

*The Commission went into closed session at 11:37 a.m.*

*Also present was Deputy City Attorney, Cecilia Mangoba and Deputy City Attorney Brad Russi.*

Existing Litigation:

*DFEH v. City and County of San Francisco*

*San Francisco Superior Court No. CGC-17-560827*

**c. CASE NO. 2016-01: COMMISSION DELIBERATIONS ON PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT, AND POSSIBLE APPROVAL OF FINDINGS OF FACT REGARDING COMMISSION'S DECISION ON EMPLOYEE SUSPENSION APPEAL, FOR VIOLATIONS AS FOLLOWS:**

The appeal is from a ten calendar day suspension for violation of the Rules and Regulations as follows:

Section 2801 – Thorough Knowledge

Section 2805 – Leadership

Section 2807 – Dangerous & Unsafe Conditions

Section 2808 – Welfare of Subordinates

Section 3907 – Safety Rules

Section 3922—Inaptitude for Duty/Incompetence

Section 3923 – Acts Detrimental to the Welfare of the Department

At a special meeting on December 1, 2017, the Commission unanimously voted to sustain and confirm the 10-day suspension and found member guilty of all charges outlined above. The Commission is now considering proposed Findings of Fact in relation to that decision. **[Action item]**

**d. DEPARTMENT PHYSICIAN PERFORMANCE EVALUATION**

Pursuant to Admin. Code section 67.10(b); Govt. Code section 54957(b), Govt. Code section 54957.1(a)(5), the Commission may hold a closed session to discuss the performance evaluation of Department Physician, Ramon Terrazas *[Discussion and possible action]*.

**11. REPORT ON ANY ACTION TAKEN IN CLOSED SESSION *[Discussion and possible action]*** as specified in California Government Code Section 54957.1(a) and San Francisco Administrative Code section 67.12(b).

*The Commission reconvened in Open Session at 12:09 p.m. Mr. Russi reported that the Commission unanimously agreed to approve the Findings of Fact in Item Number 10(c) and continue Item 10(d) to a subsequent meeting to be decided.*

**13. VOTE TO ELECT WHETHER TO DISCLOSE ANY OR ALL DISCUSSIONS HELD IN CLOSED SESSION**, as specified in San Francisco Administrative Code Section 67.12(a). **[Action]**

*Commissioner Covington Moved to not disclose discussions held in closed session. Vice President Nakajo Seconded. The motion was unanimously approved. (5-0; Cleaveland, Nakajo, Hardeman, Covington, Veronese)*

**14. ADJOURNMENT** President Cleaveland adjourned the meeting at 12:11 p.m. in honor of retired Firefighter Al Fiorese and retired Battalion Chief Bill Correll who both recently passed away