

.SAN FRANCISCO FIRE COMMISSION

**FIRE COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING
MINUTES**

Wednesday, March 9, 2016 - 9:00 a.m.

City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 416, San Francisco, California, 94102

The Video can be viewed by clicking this link:

http://sanfrancisco.granicus.com/MediaPlayer.php?view_id=180&clip_id=24878

President Covington called the meeting to order at 9:00 AM.

1. ROLL CALL

Commission President	Francee Covington	Present
Commission Vice President	Ken Cleaveland	Present
Commissioner	Stephen Nakajo	Present
Commissioner	Michael Hardeman	Present
Chief of Department	Joanne Hayes-White	Present
Raemona Williams	Deputy Chief – Administration	
Ken Lombardi	Support Services	
Shane Francisco	Homeland Security	
Dan DeCossio	Bureau of Fire Prevention	
Richard Brown	Bureau of Fire Prevention	
Jeff Columbini	Division of Training	
Tony Molloy	EMS	
Assistant Chiefs		
Tom Siragusa	Division 3	
Staff		
Mark Corso	CFO	
Clement Yeh	Medical Director	

2. PUBLIC COMMENT

Captain Whooley, who identified himself as President of the San Francisco Fire Department EMS Officers Association expressed his concerns about their rank and no movement from the administration to correct the problems that are visible as well as staffing positions appropriately. He mentioned that RC 4 is still being held hostage at Station 49 in a movement to get them to agree to a 12-hour shift with the paramedic captains. He concluded by encouraging the administration to put RC 4 back on line.

3. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES *[Discussion and possible action]*

Discussion and possible action to approve meeting minutes.

- Minutes from Regular Meeting on February 10, 2016

President Covington made an amendment to the minutes by adding under Item 7, Resolution 2016-04 that the gift from the Pastor Revocable Trust initially indicated the monies were to go to the Fire Department's 150th Anniversary but that was changed to the purchase of firefighting equipment because this was in line with the wishes expressed in the trust.

Commissioner Hardeman Moved to approve the February 10, 2016 regular meeting Minutes as amended. Commissioner Cleveland Seconded. Motion to approve above Minutes as amended was unanimous.

There was no public comment on this item.

4. UPDATE ON EMS-6 PROGRAM

Dr. Clement Yeh to provide update on EMS-6 since implementation of program.

Dr. Yeh introduced himself as the Medical Director of the Department. President Covington congratulated him on his recent award and wonderful profile in the Sunday Chronicle and stated how very proud they are of him. Dr. Yeh thanked her. He continued his presentation by providing an update on the EMS 6 program. He introduced Paramedic Captains April Bassett and Simon Pang who have signed on as part of the EMS-6 Team. It also consists of an H-33 EMS Captain who operates in a paramedic supervisor role, as well as another team member who is a Department of Public Health Homeless Outreach team specialist, who is co-staffed with the Paramedic captain, and is the primary for the patient care coordination role. He stated that EMS-6 Operations started on January 30, 2016 and the main function is to work in conjunction with existing services to stabilize high users and refer them to non-emergency programs. He added that they have defined an EMS high user as someone who calls 9-1-1 more than four times a month or more than twice a day. Additionally, the high users are people who utilize multiple systems in our city. Those other systems would be the local emergency rooms, sobering centers, urgent care clinics, psychiatric emergency facilities, and 9-1-1. They have also defined EMS super users as patients that generate 15 calls or more a month and include homeless patients that utilize EMS, ER's, psychiatric providers and sobering centers, at the highest rates in the City. He stated that they engage them daily and follow their progress which has resulted in better outcomes in collaboration with other providers in coming up with clinical management plans for their care. Captain Pang and Captain Bassett provided examples of these types of patients.

His presentation is attached:

<https://sfgov.org/sffd/sites/default/files/COMMISSION/Fire%20Commission%20Support%20Documents%202015/FireCommission030916%20EMS%206.pptx>

Dr. Yeh concluded by stating that continuing to identify barriers to patient care is going to be an ongoing mission for them.

Vice President Cleveland thanked Dr. Yeh for his presentation and congratulated his team for the excellent work they are doing. He added that he looks forward to more success stories in the future. He also agreed that the program should be a 24-hour operation. Vice President Cleveland asked what type of patient is the most frequent user of the system. Dr. Yeh stated there are many challenges in really figuring the patient type, because you may have patients with complex medical issues, psychiatric behavioral issues, substance and or alcohol abuse issues or a combination of the above.

Chief Hayes-White acknowledged Deputy Chief of Operations, Mark Gonzales, EMS Assistant Deputy Chief, Jeff Myers and EMS Section Chief, Tony Molloy, who have all been part and parcel to restoring the EMS-6 program. She added that they lobbied heavily to restore this program in collaboration with the Department of Public Health, and Dr. Yeh, Captain Bassett and Captain Pang, have really put their heart and soul into it. She thanked Dr. Yeh and Paramedic Captains April Bassett and Simon Pang and acknowledged how dedicated they are. It takes a special person for the work that they're doing and it is very much appreciated. She also mentioned that she would like to see it expanded. She added that they have about five weeks of data and they will continue to collect that data and analyze it, and that will be the foundation on which they may be able to expand the program. She also mentioned that they meet regularly with DPH and they will be meeting next week with members of the EMS 6 program, as well as the mayor's office to talk about the data that they have collected so far.

Commissioner Hardeman congratulated Dr. Yeh for the recent awards he received. He also thanked Captain Bassett and Captain Pang and all the other paramedic and EMT staff who are participating in EMS-6 effort and for their compassion and dedication. He added that he would like to see this program operate 24 hours a day.

Commissioner Nakajo thanked the EMS-6 team and was glad to hear it is a team effort with the Fire Department. He added that he also appreciated the data that was provided and found it to be very helpful. He stated that he also appreciated the samples of the real life stories they have encountered. Commissioner Nakajo stated he thought it is important as a fire department to coordinate services and partnerships with other agencies. He asked if there was a breakdown of the number of individuals seeking services that are not local residents. Dr. Pang stated they don't have any hard numbers, but anecdotally, there seems to be a large number of people who have come to the City over the years, and it is something that EMS 6 will be tracking in the future.

Vice President Cleaveland stated that he thinks the EMS 6 is one of the most important programs operating in the City and wanted to know what kind of budget it would take to run the program 24/7. Mr. Corso answered they would have to essentially double the annual \$475,000 budget, which would be close to a million dollars to run a 24 hour operation. He added that he thought conversations surrounding the program was that there would be ongoing discussions, not necessarily as part of the Fire Department operations, but as part of the overall city wide effort on homelessness that the program, once implemented, would be evaluated and if there were the decision to make additional resources available, that could be incorporated as part of the overall budget request.

President Covington echoed the sentiments of her fellow Commissioners in congratulating Dr. Yeh and stated what a fabulous program EMS 6 was. She asked for more information about how they interact with the Health Department outside of the hospital setting. Dr. Yeh explained their function in detail, and added that the Department of Health is an integral part of the team and they are co-staffed, so at any given time both the paramedic captains, and the outreach worker who is on duty respond to all calls collaboratively and depending on the nature of the call they decide the action of services needed. President Covington also asked for more information on the outreach workers and what falls under their administrative umbrella. Dr. Yeh stated that anything that doesn't fall into the normal 9-1-1 response is the primary purview of the outreach workers. He added that it's a team approach but the outreach workers, especially with the super users, have extensive histories with these clients so they take a lot of the responsibility in terms

of documentation, conversations, referrals, transport referrals and case management and they are an integral part of the team. Captain Pang added that model is different than EMS. The outreach workers work largely on a voluntary basis. They might come up to an individual and offer them resources, but if that individual says no, there's not much more they can do. But once that individual calls 9-1-1, it becomes the Department's responsibility, it's mandated that they respond at any hour and mitigate the problem and that's when they bring in that outreach worker to fix things right then, and with their knowledge and ability to network with the shelters and other available services, it has been working well.

Public Comment: Captain Whooley stated that he strongly endorses the actions of EMS 6. Historically in the department when Captain Tangherlini's innovative program was terminated by the current administration, the role fell upon the RCs to take on that position. A role they were inadequately prepared for and were never provided the appropriate amount of information for. He added to have EMS 6 after a significant number of years actually reactivated has assisted them greatly. However, from the hours from midnight to noon, they are still operating with the paramedic captains being the de facto EMS 6. He strongly encouraged the Commission to move to a 24-hour role for this job. He concluded by stating the EMS Officers Association would strongly endorse a 24-hour operation for EMS 6.

5. SAN FRANCISCO FIRE SAFETY TASK FORCE

Update from Fire Marshal Daniel DeCossio on Final Report of January 19, 2016 prepared by the San Francisco Fire Safety Task Force.

President Covington welcomed Fire Marshal DeCossio. He summarized the interagency Fire Safety Task Force report that was put forward by the Board of Supervisors and is attached:

<http://sf-fire.org/sites/default/files/COMMISSION/Fire%20Commission%20Support%20Documents%202015/Fire%20Safety%20Task%20Force%20Final%20Report%2001-19-16.pdf>

Fire Marshal DeCossio touched on the ordinance itself and the thought behind it, why it came about, the mandate, the recommendations put forth by the committee, and the actions the Bureau of Fire Prevention has taken at this time. He stated the Ordinance Number 90-15 went into effect in June of 2015. It created an interagency Fire Safety Task Force. There were seven members assigned to that task force committee, two from the fire department, he was one of the members on the committee representing fire as well as Assistant Fire Marshal Rich Brown, two members from the Building Department, one from Housing, two members from DPH, and one member from PUC. There were six meetings and all were open to the public. They took input from the tenants, landlords, and building owners. He added that the reasoning behind the whole thought of putting forward this ordinance, was in response to recent fires in multi-unit residential buildings that resulted in death and displacement of tenants. The thought was to get a think tank together, and put forward recommendations to increase fire safety. The mandate put forward to the committee was to recommend ways to improve fire safety and propose amendments to municipal code regarding fire prevention measures, post fire investigation, processing of complaints, and interagency coordination and to recommend to the Board of Supervisors the advisability of retroactive requirements for sprinkler and fire alarm requirements for residential buildings. He continued to outline the above report.

Vice President Cleaveland thanked Fire Marshal DeCossio for the report and stated it is extremely important that the entities work together on this issue. He added that it has been long

overdue as to what the deficiencies are in actual fire prevention within the city and county of San Francisco and he applauds the report and thinks every one of the recommendations need to be implemented. There was conversation about the cost of implementing the recommendations and Fire Marshal DeCossio explained that one size does not fit all, so it's complicated to come up with an amount. Vice President Cleaveland recommended that the BOS should have the Task Force reconvene and report on what has been accomplished in one year's time.

Commissioner Nakajo thanked Chief DeCossio and asked if there are rates of priority for a Notice of Violation. Chief DeCossio explained that a Notice of Violation is anything that is non-compliant with the fire code for the maintenance and those get issued after a notice of correction is not met within the reasonable amount of time to abate.

Commissioner Hardeman acknowledged how Chief DeCossio has his hands full with paperwork and that he seems to be adjusting quite well and complimented him on his dedication and the precise report.

President Covington stated that she appreciated the comprehensive report and asked who was in charge of prioritizing the recommendations and following through since the task force has been disbanded. Fire Marshal DeCossio stated the report goes to the Board of Supervisors and they evaluate and put forward proposals from the report, so it's in the hands of the Board of Supervisors at this time. President Covington stated that there seems to be a lot of competing needs, particularly for small apartment building owners and the recommendations are almost prohibitive and costly. She mentioned her concern with these issues and the shortage of housing that already exists in the City. President Covington also suggested that tenants should get the layout of the floor plan/emergency exits when they sign the lease. Fire Marshal DeCossio explained how fire blocks in the wall work.

There was no public comment.

6. STATION 49 AND RESCUE CAPTAIN STAFFING

Deputy Chief Gonzales and EMS staff to address staffing model.

While Deputy Chief Gonzalez was preparing to present the report on this item, Chief Hayes-White stated for the record that as it's related to the staffing model, there was public comment made at a February 10th meeting and what they endeavor to do is always state the facts. She stated that a public comment was made during the February 10, 2016 meeting, that on December 2, 2015 at an incident in the Bayview that there was no Rescue Captain on scene. She stated that is an inaccurate statement. After that statement was made they checked the run of that incident, and not only did they have units on the scene within four minutes, the engine company and battalion chief within five minutes, a truck company within eight minutes, but they did in fact have a rescue captain on scene at about nine and-a-half minutes and he remained on scene for 26 minutes. She added that it's been on her mind and she wanted to provide the facts on that particular statement and correct the record.

Chief Gonzales introduced Section Chief of EMS Molloy and they discussed the reason the Rescue Captains need to be on a 12 hour shift as opposed to a 24 hour shift. Chief Molloy gave a brief overview of the daily tasks that are assigned to the captain at Station 49. He stated some of the tasks include managing all the employees who come in and out on a daily basis, the fleet maintenance, scheduling, ensuring employees wellbeing, stress management issues, employee injuries, making sure the ambulances get restocked at the end of the shift and taking charge of

the controlled substances issued to the ambulance. He added that they handle the logistics program at Station 49, so they have varied and complex jobs to do. They do a good job and give one hundred percent, but that being said, having one person assigned to handle all those functions for a 24 hour period leads to things falling through the cracks and after 12 hours behind a desk doing all these things, they're bound to get tired and weary.

Chief Myers, Assistant Deputy Chief of EMS elaborated on Chief Molloy's comments. He stated that Station 49 has evolved and continues to change on a daily basis. The span of control has been and now with the continued growth, simply untenable. The daily workload of the station officer is overwhelming and to have one officer on a 24 hour shift overseeing all the needs of EMS operations and the needs of 70 plus employees a day coming and going. He added that what Chief Molloy put forth in his overview is just a small glimpse of the daily tasks. He went on to explain other concerns of having a supervisor working a 24-hour shift. He stated that he believes it is in the best interest of Station 49, its members, and overall long term to the officers tasked with these responsibilities to move to a 12-hour shift for the station officers to address the myriad of issues listed above, to provide day and night supervisor access and coverage as the operation at Station 49 is truly 24/7 and to match the actual hours which the station members work with the supervisor's hours that are charged with their responsibility for their welfare.

Chief Gonzales agreed with everything that Chief Molloy and Chief Myers said and reiterated that the captain's position at Station 49 needs to be a 12-hour shift. It's a no brainer.

Dr. Yeh commented that in regards to the controlled substance, there are federal and local policies that govern oversight over controlled substances such as Morphine and Midazolam and it's important that they provide pain relief for the people that they serve, but it's also important in terms of regulatory standpoint that they have very tight controls to make sure that all the medications are available and accounted for at all times. He added that it is a big responsibility for everybody in the system.

Chief Hayes-White responded to the comments by stating she thinks they heard loud and clear from the staff the recommendations that have been made regarding the staffing model at Station 49. She added that it is a growing operation and it is one that will grow into, hopefully with the passage of the 2016 Health Bond, to a state-of-the-art facility. She continued that at this time, it is not a safe operation or an efficient model as we're growing and it would be irresponsible of her to recommend anything different than a 12-hour shift. The supervisory model in any good organization, should mirror and reflect the model of what your subordinates are working. Certainly in public safety it even heightens that. The employees deserve the support no matter what time they're rolling in the door or rolling out the door, of a supervisor to see how their shift went or if they need anything. It shouldn't matter if they're coming on at 8:00 in the morning or 11:00 at night. She concluded by stating they should have a consistent presence of a supervisor, not only for accountability but also for support.

Vice President Cleaveland thanked them for their report. He mentioned that resolving the issue is something they'd all like the parties to sit down in good faith and resolve somehow. He asked how other departments model their EMS divisions. Chief Myers answered it depends on the size and scope of the operations and how much down time they have in a particular 24 hour period for rest. He added that the goal is to have a EMS Division managed effectively and efficiently as

possible and would push the parties together to come up with some compromise that would work.

Commissioner Nakajo thanked everyone for their report. He asked what the reason was from moving from a 12-hour lieutenant supervisory shift to three rescue captains on the 24-hour shift. Chief Hayes-White said it was her recollection that moving to a 24-hour shift was when they had a smaller work force and it was more appreciated by the membership. Now that the operation has grown in that there are so many different shift starts and not like the firehouse where everyone starts at 8:00 a.m. There was robust discussion on the pros and cons of the 12-hour v. the 24-shift for the Rescue Captains at Station 49.

Commissioner Hardeman thanked them for their report as well as the members who spoke during public comment. He acknowledged it's a very complex situation but everybody is doing what they think is right for the people they're acting for and he commended everybody on doing their best and he heard good arguments. Chief Gonzales stated he would continue after the meeting to sit down with President Tom O'Connor and try and come up with something and make a recommendation to the chief.

President Covington thanked everyone and stated she had many questions, but that the hour was late and the meeting needs to end at noon, and for the purpose of transparency and keeping the citizens in San Francisco apprised of what going on, she would continue with the Chief's report. She did suggest sending a survey to the members of Station 49 regarding the shift issue as they should have an opportunity to express their opinions and desires regarding this issue.

Public Comment: Captain Crawford, Senior Captain at Station 49 stated some things were omitted from the report from his superiors. He stated when Station 49 was incepted, there were three officers on and they worked 12-hour shifts. He added that it proved not to be very effective in 2006 and the officer's changed to three 24-hour shifts which proved to be more effective than the 12 hour shift. He continued on how he addresses every issue that is brought to his attention and that he takes his job seriously. He concluded by stating he is open to further dialogue on this subject and he thinks he has a lot of insight on the situation since he is the Senior Captain.

Captain Whooley, President of the SF EMS Officers Association stated he was astonished that the subject of sleep has come up. He stated the problem is not the 24 hour shift, it's the four month rotation. He stated that they have asked the administration to go to a fixed schedule where they could bid on schedules every year, just like the remainder of the fire department and the response has been, no you need to go to a 12-hour shift. He continued by describing his experience being a Captain at Station 49 and they do not agree to the 12-hour shift.

Captain Salan commented that he has worked five years at Station 49 and is very familiar with the operations there and he agrees with Captain Whooley and Chief Myers that the workload at any given moment at Station 49 can be overwhelming. He encouraged the Commission and the administration to up staff the EMS program to where it can properly manage the many employees. He added that the issues with narcotics at Station 49 is embarrassing the way they are handled and he suggested the department purchase a Pixa system or something similar as it's a very efficient and more accurate way of handling narcotics.

Tom O'Connor, President of San Francisco Firefighters Union spoke in support of the EMS Officers Association and the men and women of Station 49. He added the one central theme that

they've been hearing about Station 49, both from the administration and the frontline supervisors is the workload and the span of control. He added that changing the length of the shift isn't going to change the workload, they need additional personnel at Station 49. He stated that additional personnel is needed to manage the growing workforce and by not putting RC-4 back in the field and holding up the six promotional jobs, the Department is jeopardizing patient care in the southern sector of the City and changing the length of the shift is not the solution.

7. CHIEF OF DEPARTMENT'S REPORT [Discussion]

REPORT FROM CHIEF OF DEPARTMENT

Report on current issues, activities and events within the Department since the Fire Commission meeting of February 24, 2016, including Fiscal Year 2015-2016 budget, staffing changes, academies, strategic planning, 150th Anniversary update, including Fireboat naming contest, special events, communications and outreach to other government agencies and the public.

Chief Hayes-White's report covered the period from February 24, 2016. She congratulated the reappointments of Commissioner Michael Hardeman and Commissioner Steve Nakajo to the Fire Commission. She added that she thought the Mayor made a very wise decision and she continues to look forward to working them. She mentioned that they submitted the budget in a timely fashion on February 22, 2015 and they will be having ongoing discussion with the Mayor's office. She confirmed that the Budget Committee Meeting with the Mayor's Budget Director, Kate Howard will take place on March 25. She added that they continue to work on the 2016 Bond, which is a \$350,000,000 bond, of which 58 million is earmarked for the Fire Department, 44 million specifically for the EMS deployment facility, which will be constructed in the rear of Station 9. In regards to staffing changes, she acknowledged Firefighter Keith Baraka, her selection as recruitment coordinator and invited him up to describe his new position.

Firefighter Baraka explained that he's been in this department for 20 years. He gave a history of his assignments throughout his 20 years. Since taking the recruitment coordinator position, he has had a lot of recruits come and talk to him. He acknowledged that they have put together a recruitment committee consisting of about 8 members from the Department representing most of the employee groups. He added that along with their recruiting efforts, DHR has been a tremendous help in establishing resources and in helping with overall recruiting efforts, including providing brochures, and information fliers. He stated that their overall goal is to reach out to prospective recruits, and provide support through the process. He added that he is very excited to be in the position.

Commissioner Cleaveland welcomed Keith Baraka and acknowledged his talents and leadership abilities. He asked FF Baraka if he had a list of organizations that he will reach out to. FF Baraka stated that he would be more than happy to get referrals from the Commission on additional organizations to reach out to and that he is taking all the suggestions he can get.

Commissioner Nakajo also welcomed FF Baraka and offered as a resource, the Asian Pacific Islander Community and stated he would be happy to meet with him.

Commissioner Hardeman and President Covington also welcomed FF Baraka.

Chief Hayes-White continued with her report by stating the 119th academy was in their seventh week and the class consisted of 53 recruits. She touched on the process of establishing dates for the "bump up academy," which is a promotional opportunity for H-3 Level 1 EMT's with paramedic licenses to then become paramedics in level 2. She added that they are in the early

stages of planning for the 120th Academy. She mentioned that the kickoff for the 150th Anniversary celebration will be a soft start on April 17th with the NERT drill and the official kick off celebration will be April 18th and events planned through December 3, 2016. One of the events will be a naming contest for the fireboat. She touched on the status of the Strategic Planning Committee and stated they will be meeting on March 28, 2016 with the goal of having the subcommittee reports synthesized for review. She mentioned the upcoming St. Patrick's Day Parade and invited everyone to join them March 12, 2016 at 2nd and Market. She announced that in conjunction with the Department of Emergency Management, PG & E, NERT, 3-1-1, Alert SF and DPW that they all worked together to refine the guidelines for informing the public during emergencies, including if a shelter in place has been issued, if an evacuation order has been issued, when they have been lifted and what to do, where to go and how to prepare for these types of incidents.

President Covington thanked the Chief for her report and asked how much money has been raised for the 150th Anniversary celebration. Chief Hayes-White stated she was proud to announce that they have raised approximately \$450,000.00 in private donations and she hopes to raise more than that. She also announced the website that has been dedicated to the 150th anniversary "all things 150th."

President Covington congratulated Commissioner Hardeman and Commissioner Nakajo on their swearing in as reappointed Fire Commissioners.

There was no public comment.

REPORT FROM OPERATIONS

Report on overall field operations, including to greater alarm fires, Emergency Medical Services, the Bureau of Fire Prevention & Investigation, and the Airport Division.

President Covington suggested because of the time constraints, holding the Operations Report until the next Commission Meeting, that in the meantime, the Commissioners could review the written report and have Chief Gonzales present at the next meeting.

8. COMMUNICATIONS ADDRESSED TO THE COMMISSION RECEIVED SINCE LAST MEETING

- Letter from NERT Advisory Board dated 3/3/16

There was no public comment.

9. AGENDA FOR NEXT FIRE COMMISSION MEETING [Discussion]

Discussion regarding agenda for the March 23, 2016 regular meeting.

President Covington stated that she would consult with the Vice President and Chief to develop the March 23, 2016 agenda.

There was no public comment.

10. ADJOURNMENT

President Covington adjourned the meeting at 11:59 a.m.