

MINUTES OF THE FIRE COMMISSION SPECIAL MEETING
April 5, 2022 – 10:00 AM

President Feinstein called the meeting to order at 10:00 a.m.

Item No.

1. ROLL CALL

President	Katherine Feinstein
Vice President	Stephen A. Nakajo
Commissioner	Francee Covington
Commissioner	Armie Morgan

Also present: Court Reporter Kayla Knowles
Member
Chief Jeanine Nicholson
Deputy City Attorney Jennifer Stoughton
Deputy City Attorney Brad Russ
Adam Wood, Local 798
Fire Commission Secretary Maureen Conefrey

2. CASE NO. 2021-07: HEARING AND DELIBERATIONS ON VERIFIED COMPLAINT FILED WITH THE COMMISSION BY CHIEF OF DEPARTMENT
[Discussion and possible action]

On November 3, 2021, Chief of Department Jeanine Nicholson filed a Verified Complaint with the Fire Commission against member for a non-disciplinary separation

This case may be heard in Closed Session pursuant to Government Code Section 54957(b) and San Francisco Administrative Code Section 67.10(b).

A. Public Comment on Special Meeting Agenda Item; Possible Closed Session

Members of the public may comment on all matters pertaining to Agenda Item 2 and whether to consider the matter in closed session. [Government Code §54954.3(a), Administrative Code §67.15(b)]

UNIDENTIFIED CALLER: This is Dan Yox, retired San Francisco Fire. During these termination hearings, a couple commissioners have asked good questions regarding religious exemptions. Other questions seem to have been based on fear, which is disappointing. Fear compromises your ability to make wise informed decisions. Bear with me as I ask some questions I think everyone here should be asking. Why were treatments previously determined by the NIH to be detrimental for SARS-CoV-2 the primary means of treatment for COVID? Why did several European news agencies sign the Trusted News Initiative agreeing to not report any news detrimental to vaccines? Did U.S. news agencies that receive 75 percent of their funding from pharmaceuticals make a similar agreement? Why were therapies that were successfully treating tens of thousands of patients censored along with the treating doctors who testified before Congress? These therapies would have not allowed a mid-trial experimental vaccine to be approved under the EUA. If EUA approval must be based on all of the scientific evidence, why did the FDA request the information they used from Pfizer be sealed for 75 years? And why does the FDA recall over 1,000 drugs every year, drugs

they previously deemed safe and effective? These are only a few of the many questions everyone here should be asking. These firefighters you're firing are not basing their decisions on fear. They've asked hard questions, flagged critical thinking, and have observed inappropriate government overreach. When they were hired, they took an oath to defend the Constitution. They demonstrated courage and honor, making difficult and costly decisions --

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yes, this is Greg Saven, forced to retire prematurely. Sadly we are here to witness the unlawful termination of our brother, Ryan Crow, a strong dedicated worker, husband, and father of two, the youngest being just a few months old. Everyone attending these meetings by now knows that these hearings are just a charade. The commissioners pretend to listen to statements, evidence, and facts and then pretend to actually deliberate before coming back with a predetermined outcome recommending termination. The public has been watching, and no one is fooled. The logic behind your decisions has become almost laughable. This is all based on a health order that states that the vaccine will prevent you from getting COVID. If the vaccine is so effective, then why does the chief feel it would be necessary for unvaccinated firefighters to wear masks while eating, sleeping, and taking showers to protect the vaccinated. And now the booster mandate for most City employees, excluding the fire department, has been dropped, even though the efficacy of the vaccine for most employees has probably expired by now and yet they are still allowed to work. The deadline for the fire department has been moved -- moved to June 15th, just far enough out to get through the last of these shameful hearings, and then I'm sure the fire department's booster mandate will be dropped as well. Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED CALLER: Okay. Great. Here's a question a Commissioner might want to ask. If the vaccinated can catch and spread COVID, why aren't they being fired? If the unvaccinated are being fired for not following orders, why is this a nondisciplinary separation? Shouldn't it be disciplinary? We have -- one Commissioner thinks that she's saving people's lives by firing them. One Commissioner is on record saying she gets her information from the Chronicle but would not allow a doctor's expert testimony and suggested natural immunity was conspiracy theories. The doctor for the fire department is on record stating the shot is for yourself, and you wear a mask to protect others. Oh, and the San Francisco Police Department can arrest a vulnerable population, ride in the back of an ambulance with them, go into a high-risk setting of a hospital, and then take them to another high-risk setting of a jail and not have a booster. So you also have people in the fire department working without a booster for over 16 months and still being allowed to work. Is this making any sense for anyone? Also, Ms. Stoughton -- I hope she brings it up again today. She really needs to read the health order. Section 6, Roman Numeral I and II, you don't need to wear a mask at all times. You need to wear a mask while working in a high-risk setting. A firehouse is not a high-risk setting. Safeway is not a high-risk setting. Appendix A, Sections A, B, and D specifically state you do not need -- people do not need to wear a mask indoors while showering, eating, or sleeping. Why are the commissioners letting them keep lying and misstating the facts over and over and over? I know we all hate unvaccinated people. I know they're horrible, but --

UNIDENTIFIED CALLER: Ethical scientists and doctors are screaming from the rooftop about the atrocities that are being perpetrated against the population. At this point, willful ignorance or malfeasance is what's driving you all to proceed with this crime. This isn't going to well for anyone, including all of you conducting this injustice. You should be ashamed of yourselves and seriously look inward to salvage what's left of your souls. You can't pretend you're trying to help when you're actively causing great harm physically and psychologically. I pray one of you takes the time to read what the media is admitting and stop calling us conspiracy theorists. The data is available with the pharmaceutical companies we're trying for -- and bury for 50 years. You should

all be informed that what you're engaged in is conspiracy. You think very little of this good man Ryan's career, but I bet you care about yours. Just know, when this whole mess is sorted out, you better have some other means of making a living other than the position you hold now. Our command staff was engaged in harassing, intimidating, and a coercing aspect, if we didn't take the shot, we would lose our pension. In order to lose our pensions, we would have had to commit a crime of moral turpitude. Ironically, this is what you're all guilty of now, abusing your power to falsely accuse the firehouse, as a crime of highest moral failure, in my opinion. You will be judged more harshly than this man now. You think you can stand behind the City attorneys by using the excuse you were following orders. You mock us in your sincere beliefs and have destroyed our careers. I don't think anyone will be feeling sorry for any of you when the hammer falls on your corruption. This commission and all are engaged in criminal behavior. You have engaged in the crime of extreme bias --

UNIDENTIFIED CALLER: Yes, I would. Thank you. Good morning, brothers and sisters prematurely retired. Welcome to the kangaroo court of the San Francisco Fire Department where the decision to terminate Firefighter Crow has been made before these proceedings began. The City and County of San Francisco has found a booster mandate -- has ended the booster mandate for all City departments, except the fire department. Interesting, perplexing. Could that be because all of you sitting in predetermined judgment would look even worse if you continue firing loyal firefighters with no mandate? Never mind the vaccine has never worked to begin with. Regardless of what Ms. Stoughton says, the vaccines do -- do not prevent catching or spreading COVID. They do not prevent that. The word "prevent" is not a red herring. It is not a distraction. Rather, it means what it means, to keep from happening or existing. We all know the vaccines did neither. Spare me the argument that it keeps people from severe illness or being hospitalized. That is a red herring. That is a distraction. Check San Francisco General Hospital numbers on 21 January 20, 2022. 69 COVID patients: 19 of those were unvaccinated, 32 were vaccinated, and 18 were vaxed and boosted. 50 of the 69 COVID patients at San Francisco General Hospital on January 20, 2022, were fully vaccinated. 18 of those boosted. 72 percent of the COVID patients were fully vaccinated. The vaccines prevent nothing, Commissioner Morgan. I will continue to hope and pray that all of you misinformed people sitting in unconstitutional judgment, Firefighter Crow will find the courage and moral fortitude to acknowledge the truth. God bless you all. We'll be praying for you.

UNIDENTIFIED CALLER: Hello, everyone. I'm Kathy Johnson. Thank you for giving me a moment to speak on Ryan's behalf. I've known Ryan for nine years. That is when he started dating my daughter, Laura. They were married in 2015, which makes Ryan by son-in-law. My husband really liked Ryan from the beginning and said this was the first real man that Laura had dated. I was talking to a client about my family, and she admired how proud I was of Ryan. I didn't realize I was proud of him; I was simply sharing a little bit about him. Ryan is special. He's a dedicated family man, he's humble, and he's kind. To give you an idea of the man that you may let go of, in August of 2020, Ryan's hometown in the Santa Cruz mountains was in trouble with forest fires. His parents still live in the area but were staying at Laura and Ryan's because they were evacuated from their home. This area relies on volunteer firefighters. He didn't want to leave his wife and infant son, but he desperately wanted to help his hometown. Ryan decided to help his brothers in the fight. His wife was in tears. I was in tears. Laura knew the kind of man that Ryan is, and she had no choice but to support him as he left to go volunteer to fight in these forest fires. I am pro vaccine and am boosted. This was my choice. We are blessed to live in America where people are given free choice. The reality is the vaccinated and nonvaccinated are both transmitting COVID. Ryan is a good man. His 2-year-old, Sean, sums it up. When you ask Sean where his daddy is beautiful,

he puts his hand over his heart. His 2-year-old sees it; I see it; you would see it too if you knew the man. We are a community that needs to support these people who risk their lives every day to save yours and your family's life. Why make this firefighter suffer from unemployment? Please rehire these firefighters today. God bless you.

UNIDENTIFIED CALLER: Good morning. To whom this may concern, my name is Charlie McCoy, captain of Station 22 of San Francisco Fire Department. I am calling on behalf of Firefighter Ryan Crow. I worked directly with Firefighter Crow at Station 36 from 2012 to 2018. Firefighter Crow is a husband, father, member of his community, and friend of myself and members of the San Francisco Fire Department. Firefighter Crow began his career with the City of Davis Fire Department for nine years and then migrated to the San Francisco Fire Department to follow in the footsteps of his grandfather, who was a lieutenant. October 13, 2021, Firefighter Crow protected the citizens of the City and County of San Francisco. Respectfully, Chief Nicholson and fire commissioners, I implore you all to reconsider separating Firefighter Crow at the end of this business day. Collectively, you're all collaborating against logic. Some day, you may look back and realize you've taken personal property rights from a member of the San Francisco Fire Department. Ask yourself, how would you feel if the state or local government practiced eminent domain against your personal property rights? Chief Nicholson, you have the ability to rescind general orders. Please consider this one. I can only hope yourself and the Fire Commission will consider putting the systems, City and County of San Francisco, and the members of the San Francisco Fire Department before the agenda of the world economic forum. Thank you for your time.

UNIDENTIFIED CALLER: Okay. Thank you. My name is David Doll. Ryan Crow introduced me to the fire service years ago. I have never known a better or more morally strong man in my life. Today I'm a captain of the City of Palo Alto. I work for the greater County of Santa Clara, who's had over 1,000 firefighters, similar to San Francisco. We went through the same ordeal with our nonvaccinated members not being able to work and pulled off the line, being a detriment to their families. Our fire chiefs, city council, and Santa Clara County Health worked collectively together and concluded that they could figure out a safe way to reintroduce these nonvaccinated personnel. For us, they do a rapid test prior to each shift, and they need to wear mask when and around the station. This gives the San Francisco the option to be able to make things work. We have not seen an increase in our vaccinated people spreading COVID-19 or an increase in our firefighters who are vaccinated by allowing this action. Currently we are -- the fire service is in a hiring crisis, and we're losing hundreds of firefighters to -- not allowing these firefighters to come back to work because the unvaccinated will be a detriment to the fire service, to the city, and to the citizens we are sworn to protect. Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED CALLER: Thank you. I started working with Ryan Crow in 2016. We were tour buddies at Station 36, which means we worked watch for watch. I got to see that Ryan was an excellent firefighter. He's someone that you can plug into any spot on any rig, meaning he would work anywhere on the engine. He could be the driver, the firefighters, the EMT. We could detail him to a truck. He could drive it. He could tiller it. He could do whatever you wanted, and he could even drive the tees, and he was excellent in that role as well. Ever since Ryan was 18, he has made his own decisions on vaccines. It was a personal medical choice, not political one. He is an exceptional employee. He is in for everything. He thinks of others before himself. He stepped up to be the house collector of 36 when it was vacant. It is a job that is -- it's very difficult and, you know, underappreciated. He volunteered to oversee all the HAZMAT tools and equipment were up to spec at Station 36, and to be the point of contact to repair all the CGIs used by the HAZMAT unit, the squads, and all ten battalion chiefs. When Ryan was at BR36, he had a medical issue which he had to

take some time off of work. The guys at the station went out of their way to donate time or to work trades because Ryan is so well-respected by his coworkers. It would be devastating to lose an employee like Ryan Crow. He left a position as a firefighter with another jurisdiction because all he wanted to do was work for the San Francisco Fire Department. If there's any way to retain Ryan, I implore you to look into it. Maybe some type of alternative offered besides vaccination or termination.

UNIDENTIFIED CALLER: My name is Mory Lamo. I'm a 13-year veteran of the Berkeley Fire Department. I've known Ryan since the first grade. Since I've known Ryan, he's always wanted to be a San Francisco firefighter, just like his grandfather. Ryan was absolutely who steered me towards a career in the fire service. Ryan is a friend, role model, and mentor to me. He's who I picked to pin my badge at my ceremony when I was hired with the Berkeley Fire Department. Berkeley still has unvaxed firefighters and City employees who are currently allowed to work, if they wear a mask and get tested regularly. I am currently home sick with COVID right now, and I implore vaccinated and pro vaccines. The vaccine has not stopped you from spreading it or contracting it. I hope that you will allow Ryan to keep his job. He's a father of two young kids. Please do not strip his livelihood from him. Thank you.

This is Dana Tomhayo, forced to retire due to the mandate. There are four questions we ask patients to determine if they are of sound mind to make an informed medical decision, which, in some cases, might cost them their lives. Those questions: What city are you in? What's the date? Who's the president? And -- PRESIDENT FEINSTEIN: Ma'am, I'm sorry. I am going to have to ask you to slow down on behalf of the court reporter, please. UNIDENTIFIED CALLER: Those questions -- what city are you in, what's the date, who is the president, and how many quarters in a dollar -- if they answer those four questions, then they have the right to make a medical decision that the crew has to respect, even if they don't agree with it. We would be with someone who has taken a bad fall and cracks their head open, and they could potentially die without medical care if they answer those four silly questions. We have them sign an AMA, against medical advice, and they get to go home. I am sure that all of the firefighters that have come before this Commission know the answers to those questions. Therefore, in the eyes of EMS and the fire department, they should be given the same rights as our patients, even if the Commission, the chief, and the department doctor all think that, by not doing this medical intervention, they could die. As to the risks -- excuse me. As to the risks involved with taking an experimental injection, there should be informed consent, which I am sure was not given to one person in the fire department. I urge you all to check out the FDA.org Web site, which basically says no investigator may involve a human being as a subject in research unless he has obtained the legally effected informed consent of the subject without coercion or undue influence. The informed consent process is not only an ethical obligation for doctors, it is also a legal one. The doctor's required to discuss your diagnosis, the recommended treatment, and alternative treatment, and the risks associated with both and the consequences of taking no action at all. If the doctor fails to obtain informed consent for nonemergency treatment, he or she may be charged --

UNIDENTIFIED CALLER: I wish to speak on behalf of Firefighter Ryan Crow and on behalf of all those who respect the value of public service and those who fight to uphold freedom of medical choice. I ask this Fire Commission to please start protecting the livelihoods of our public service workers so that we can continue to protect our communities, so many of which are in a critical state of distress. The individuals who are losing their badges to mandates have all been through rigorous

UNIDENTIFIED CALLER: My name is Michael Cricket, unlawfully terminated March 16th. I don't think there's anything I could really say that's going to make a difference here, and I don't think I am going to be able to follow up with anything that everyone has not already said before me; so I'm just going to start by saying, Ryan, you're a good man, a good family man. Keep standing up for what you believe. Everything you're going to say today is going to go to deaf ears. These people don't care. Look outside their window. Look what they turned our city into. It's a complete war zone, but yet they pat each other on the back as if they're doing great things for their city. It's one of the worst cities in the nation. 2 They said they're ready to replace all of the civil servants if we refuse the shot, but yet PD -- about 5 or 600 of them were going to stand in solidarity. All of a sudden, they're moving the goal post back, something I wish we could have done for our fire department. So with that said, I am just going to do something that I thought I would never do for people with no due regard for families and people. I would never pray for them. But, today, I am actually going to pray for you guys, and that's going to be difficult for me, but I am going to do it. So with that said, I am just going to close it out by saying hold the line. All of us that are standing -- what few of us are standing in solidarity stay together, and at the very end, we're going to win this. :

UNIDENTIFIED CALLER: Commissioners, at this point, to continue this seizure is wrong. The health order clearly states that unvaccinated firefighters can work safely and efficiently with certain protocols put into place. Everything Ms. Stoughton says and Mr. Yan says is a fallacy. To go around that or to create an illusion around it is criminal. Ask yourselves, when was the last time the joint management committee disseminated accurate information of COVID? Ask the chief. Could at this point today and as of yesterday 11,000 pages of information have been presented that are not favorable to anybody that have been terminated? They are not a threat to anyone else. They are not a threat to any population. The vaccine only helps the individual at most. So ask yourselves again, what accommodations, what has been provided to this firefighter for the -- now that wasn't the 18 months prior when they were doing their job? Nothing has changed except a piece of paper that is now clear as day incorrect. You are in your full capabilities to rescind and reinstate this firefighter at the Commission and look for other avenues for these people to stay in their jobs because you're going to make a short-term decision that is going to be permanent in this man's life for his family, and the whole evolution of COVID is changing every single day. He is not a direct threat. So to continue this charade, to continue this fear is completely and utterly wrong. Make a

UNIDENTIFIED CALLER: I am Sean Hicky. I'm one of the current chiefs at Station 36, and I'm here to speak on behalf of Ryan Crow's character. I've known Ryan Crow for many years before he came to San Francisco Fire Department from his previous position with the Davis Fire Department. Since he's been in the Department, we've grown closer as friends than anything. I see this man growing in every aspect of this job, as an -- as a, you know, young man with children, a father, a husband. Every day, I see Ryan just doing something to help him and help others in the fire station, around the firehouse, quietly, unassuming, always happy. I've been in this fire service for about 37 years, and there's only been a handful of men that has the character and the respect that Ryan Crow has by others. I wish that the board would reconsider, you know, letting Ryan go. I know there's a lot of good firefighters that choose not to do the vaccination. It's their choice. You know, I know Ryan, up to the day he left, he was doing his best to help out in our station and the rest of the Department without hesitation. I just wanted to let the Commission to know that we're losing a lot of great people, and that's all I have to say. Thank you for your time.

UNIDENTIFIED CALLER: My name is Chris Ann Clifford Crow, and, needless to say, I am Ryan's mother. I -- Ryan had a wonderful career at the City of Davis, involved our whole family, and we loved it. His whole goal, however, his entire fire life, which started at age 14 as a volunteer where

we lived in the Santa Cruz mountains, was to work for San Francisco Fire like his grandfather did. I begged him not to, to stay in the small family-oriented department of Davis; however, he was determined, and he made it. I realized he still was in a family, and we appreciated that. I put his badge on him at the City of Davis, and he said to me, I would do this job for free. And he had said that to me often, ever since my great-grandmother was -- I'm sixth generation San Franciscan. My kids are not. I should have had them up there. But since the beginning of the turn of the century, my great-grandparents, especially my great-grandmother, fought for freedom and the right for the Chinese Laundry Workers Union to be able to be treated respectfully versus slave labor. She also fought for women's rights to vote. Not just in Santa Cruz -- or San Francisco but straight to Washington. That's allowed women to fill positions like a chief position, like an attorney, like a vice president. Our family has been committed to fighting for freedom and fairness and respect and no retaliation. Ryan has had a passion for the fire service since he was three. He --

UNIDENTIFIED CALLER: My name is -- (Reporter clarification.) PRESIDENT FEINSTEIN: His audio is blurry, at least to me. : Your connection is not coming in clear, sir. UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Okay. I'll try again. PRESIDENT FEINSTEIN: And slowly, please, sir. UNIDENTIFIED CALLER: Hi. My name is Liam Murphy. How's that? PRESIDENT FEINSTEIN: Much better. Thank you. UNIDENTIFIED CALLER: I want to remind the Commission of one thing. Your only job is to make the San Francisco Fire Department a better place. By firing Ryan Crow, you're doing the exact opposite; you're making it a worse place. Throughout my twenties, I've worked with the best of the best -- (Reporter clarification.) PRESIDENT FEINSTEIN: All right. That is the court reporter speaking, and I don't know, sir, if there's a way for you to, perhaps, change locations, or I don't know if you're inside or outside, but this does need to be recorded by the court reporter, and if she can't hear you, she can't do that. UNIDENTIFIED CALLER: Why is that? PRESIDENT FEINSTEIN: She needs to hear you in order to report as a certified court reporter must do because there will be a transcript of this entire hearing, including all the public comments that will be used. UNIDENTIFIED CALLER: Yes, ma'am. PRESIDENT FEINSTEIN: So let's try -- try again, if you can shift positions or -- or, again, I don't know if you're inside or outside, but get to a place where your audio is more clear than it is. UNIDENTIFIED CALLER: Okay. I have dialed out. How's this? PRESIDENT FEINSTEIN: Much better, and let's hope it holds. Much better. UNIDENTIFIED CALLER: All right. Hi. My name is Liam Murphy, active member of the San Francisco Fire Department and member of Station 36. I want to remind the Commission of one thing: Your only job is to make the San Francisco Fire Department a better place; by firing Ryan Crow, you are only doing this exact opposite. Ryan has done nothing but volunteered in one of the busiest stations in the nation, taking an extra job by being the lead HAZMAT specialist for the San Francisco Fire Department. These are not jobs we take lightly. These are jobs that can, at any second, take our lives. They require extra training, extra time; so therefore, by firing Ryan Crow, you are only making San Francisco Fire Department a worse place. Please think about what you are doing. Ryan Crow is a topnotch individual that is hard to find, not only in the City of San Francisco but around the world and the nation. Thank you for your time. Bye.

UNIDENTIFIED CALLER: My name is Wendy. I'm a retired medic, and I want to take the time to say what this City and Commission has done to these amazing fire fighters is beyond words. These brave men and women that run into danger when you are running out deal with people on their worst days of their lives. They were good enough for the city during the pandemic and the unknowns. It is now known that the shot doesn't stop the transmission of the flu. The chief is obviously well aware of this. Now they are dealing with a group of commissioners and fire department attorneys that are biased and unprofessional. The president of the Commission has, on numerous times, spouted that she will not allow an unvaxed first responder into her home. A fire department attorney that is

unprofessional, outing unprotected personal info of a firefighter in a public forum, condescending, speaks half truths, if that. How are these individuals able to get a fair hearing? I personally know these firefighters, medics, fire boat engineer. They have become my family. Ira, Tommy, Jeff, Sarah, Jessica, Edie, Mike, Jessica, and Will are the firefighters and medics you have fired to date. There's still Ryan, Mark, Jack, Leaf, and Marcos awaiting the chopping block. That doesn't include those that were forced to retire. I hope you think of them and remember them and their families when you go to sleep at night. Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED CALLER: Yes, I would. Thank you for the time. My name is Brian Farie. I'm a captain with the City of Davis Fire Department. I've been there for about 20 years. I've spent about half my career working with Ryan Crow, and it was an absolute pleasure. I call him a friend, a brother, and an excellent fireman. When I heard he was choosing to go to San Francisco to follow in his grandpa's legacy, I begged and pleaded with him to not go because he was such an asset to our department, an asset like he was to your Department and to the people he serves. Ryan possesses a lot of skills that most firefighters don't have and that take a lot of extra time and effort and commitment to gain. I know he -- he serves quietly with his head down, but he is one of the most capable people you'll ever meet. During the beginning of this pandemic, he -- you know, when we thought this thing was going to kill 10 percent of the population, he showed up to work, and he risked his own life. He risked his family's life at the time, selflessly serving his community. And now that we know what we know now, it's -- it's a real travesty that you're going through with this because it seems like we're just doubling down on the wrong decision. We, you know, had several members in our department that made the same decision. None of them have lost their jobs as of now, and our last nine infections were all on triple-vaxed people, and they all went home and infected their triple-vaxed families. This just doesn't have any point anymore. It's become politicized, and now you're harming people who risk everything. Firefighters don't typically live to be old men. It's part of the sacrifice of the job, and it's one that he's made. You know, he has a family. He has a son and a daughter and a wife that depend on him, and it's just not right taking away a man's livelihood like that, especially --

UNIDENTIFIED CALLER: Okay. My name is Diego Piasa, also a member of Station 36. I've been working there with Ryan Crow for about the last four years, and, again, he is just a -- kind of repeating the same thing everybody else is saying, a good man, a good person. He's kind of -- he was there previous to my time joining the station, and as I came in, he -- open mind, open heart, and kept me in the loop and tried to better myself for the station and the department as not only a fireman and driver, EMT, and all of the above, but in the HAZMAT, which is, in my opinion, the biggest asset that he has for the Department, the City, and the station. 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 Again, he's just an all-around good character, and it's frustrating to see that the decision has more than likely already been made. I hope you that you guys are listening with open ears and open hearts for keeping the Department with his strong character over the years, and, again, just try to keep in mind that it's the betterment of the Department, no politics -- all politics aside, making the best morally and ethically for the people, the city, the county, and all of the above

UNIDENTIFIED CALLER: Good morning. I am a firefighter with the City and County of San Francisco and also a member of Station 36. It was working at Station 36 that I met Firefighter Ryan Crow. Ryan has been a firefighter for 16 years. He began his career with the City of Davis. He spent nine years with Davis and left at the rank of acting captain. Ryan left the Davis Fire Department for a position with San Francisco. He gave up all his benefits and rank he held with Davis to start at the bottom of San Francisco. During his time with San Francisco, Ryan has served honorably and to the best of his ability. Ryan has spent the majority of his career at Station 36. Station 36 is a

downtown company and the third biggest engine in San Francisco. (Reporter clarification.)
PRESIDENT FEINSTEIN: I'm sorry. The court reporter -- are you having a breakup in sound, Madam Court Reporter? (Reporter clarification.) UNIDENTIFIED CALLER: I'll slow down.
PRESIDENT FEINSTEIN: Yes, please. And, again, I don't know where you're located, but if you can be in a place with the best reception you possibly can, that would be helpful because you are breaking up from time to time; so I'd appreciate it. Are you with me, sir? UNIDENTIFIED CALLER: Hello? Hello? Can you hear me? : We can hear you. UNIDENTIFIED CALLER: Okay. Station 36 is a downtown company and the third busiest engine in San Francisco. The members of Station 36 are also trained as hazardous materials specialists. Ryan is one of the leaders on the only specialized unit that responds to all hazardous materials incidents in the City of San Francisco. He is respected and often sought after for his knowledge and expertise. As a respected leader and experienced firefighter, Ryan is in the business of making calculated risk assessments. After confronting this pandemic downtown with all of the risks and uncertainty, Ryan put himself and his family at risk without question. Now being mandated to take a vaccine that does not prevent the spread of COVID, that does not protect against infection, and carries a significant risk for vaccine injury, Ryan is making another calculated decision. With vaccine mandates and booster mandates, you will continuously lose professionals of this caliber. By terminating Ryan, you have to acknowledge you are weakening your workforce. You are terminating a 16-year veteran firefighter. You are terminating all of the hazardous materials expertise --

UNIDENTIFIED CALLER: Okay. Thank you for allowing me to speak. I'm a coworker of Ryan Crow's at Engine 36. Ryan is an exceptional firefighter and a huge contributor to our HAZMAT program. I've never heard anyone speak illy of Ryan, and if you've ever met him, you would know why. He's passionate about being a firefighter, has huge amounts of integrity, is impeccably reliable, and a full -- and is full of compassion for the city he serves. It would be detrimental to both the Department and the citizens of San Francisco if Ryan was to be terminated because his stance on the COVID vaccine. Understanding that the vaccine only protects the person who receives it and actually increases the chance of exposure to patients, it's hard to accept, but it is the truth. Symptomless carriers of the virus, vaccinated or unvaccinated, are the primary reason viruses spread undetected. Weekly testing is the safest way to keep the at-risk citizens of San Francisco protected from exposures to COVID-19. In San Francisco, since March 2020, COVID has infected over 133,000 people and killed 843 of those infected. That's a .6 percent case mortality. Not to downplay the pandemic, but in the same time period, Engines 1, 3, and 36 responded to 5,851 fentanyl overdose-related calls, and 1,454 of them ended in loss of life. That is a 25 percent case mortality rate, which makes fentanyl 42 times more deadly than COVID in San Francisco. My point in all these statistics is very simple: Letting Ryan Crow --

UNIDENTIFIED CALLER: I've had the pleasure of working with him over the last year at the firehouse. He is one of the most well-rounded and talented firefighters I've worked with over my career. I feel it's a huge loss to separate him from the Department, especially his knowledge in hazardous materials for the main HAZMAT station, and his knowledge is just a great loss if he is separated from the Department. Just getting to know him over the last year, I mean, he's a great father, he's become a good friend, he was a stand-up leader in the firehouse, and he would sorely be missed. I hope you reconsider separating him from the Department so that he can continue to serve the citizens of San Francisco, and thank you for your time.

UNIDENTIFIED CALLER: Yes. This is Lieutenant Vince Pap, speaking on Firefighter Capuro's phone. Commissioners, Chief of the Department, thank you for hearing me. I'd just like to reiterate all of the character references that everyone has said about Firefighter Crow. He's a fine employee, and I hope that you consider retaining him. Thank you for your time.

B. Votes on Closed Session

Member requested an open session.

1. Whether to hold the hearing on the verified complaint in closed session [Action]
2. Whether to conduct deliberations in closed session [Action]

Commissioner Morgan Moved to hold deliberations in closed session. President Feinstein Seconded. The motion was unanimously approved.

Convened in closed session at 2:16 p.m.

Also in closed session was Deputy City Attorney Brad Russi and Fire Commission Secretary Maureen Conefrey.

C. Hearing and Deliberations

1. Hearing on verified complaint (in open or closed session, per the Commission's vote)
2. Deliberations and possible action on charges (in open or closed session, per the Commission's vote) [Discussion and Possible Action]

Commissioner Morgan Moved to find that the Chief of the Department proved by a preponderance of the evidence that Member failed to comply with the vaccination requirements of the Order of the San Francisco Health Officer No. C19-07y and the Chief of Department's General Order 21-A-70, as alleged in the Chief's Verified Complaint and to uphold the Chief's recommendation of a non-disciplinary separation. Vice President Nakajo Seconded. The Motion was unanimously approved.

D. If Closed Session is held, reconvene in Open Session

Reconvened in open session at 3:17 p.m.

1. Report on any action taken in Closed Session as specified in California Government Code Section 54957.1(a)(5) and San Francisco Administrative Code section 67.12(b)(4).
2. Vote to elect whether to disclose any or all discussions held in Closed Session, as specified in San Francisco Administrative Code Section 67.12(a). **[Action Item]**

Vice President Nakajo moved to not disclose discussion held in Closed Session. Commissioner Morgan Seconded. The motion was unanimously approved.

3. **ADJOURNMENT:** President Feinstein adjourned the meeting at 3:21 p.m.