

SAN FRANCISCO FIRE COMMISSION

**FIRE COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING
MINUTES**

Wednesday, October 10, 2018

City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 416, San Francisco, California, 94102

The Video can be viewed by clicking this link:

http://sanfrancisco.granicus.com/MediaPlayer.php?view_id=180&clip_id=31555

Vice President Nakajo called the meeting to order at 9:01 a.m.

1. ROLL CALL

Commission President	Ken Cleaveland	Present
Commission Vice President	Stephen Nakajo	Present
Commissioner	Michael Hardeman	Present
Commissioner	Francee Covington	Arrived at 9:03
Commissioner	Joe Alioto Veronese	Present
Chief of Department	Joanne Hayes-White	Present
Jeanine Nicholson	Deputy Chief --Administration	
Dan DeCossio	Bureau of Fire Prevention	
Andy Zanoft	EMS	
Tony Rivera	Support Services	
Khai Ali	Airport	
Joel Sato	Training Division	
Assistant Chiefs		
Jose Velo	Division 2	
Rex Hale	Division 3	
Staff		
Mark Corso	Deputy Director of Finance	
Olivia Scanlon	Communications and Outreach	
Tony Boone	Director of Occupational Environmental Health and Safety	

2. PUBLIC COMMENT

There was no public comment.

3. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES [Discussion and possible action]

Discussion and possible action to approve meeting minutes.

- Minutes from Special Meeting/Retreat on September 25, 2018.
- Minutes from Regular Meeting on September 26, 2018.

President Cleaveland made some typographical error amendments. Commissioner Hardeman Moved to approve the above meeting Minutes as amended. Commissioner Alioto-Veronese Seconded. Motion to approve above Minutes was unanimous.

There was no public comment.

4. PRESENTATION FROM THE ASIAN FIREFIGHTERS ASSOCIATION [Discussion]

Presentation from the Asian Firefighters Association.

Firefighter John Choy, President of the Asian Firefighters Association introduced himself and stated that he is a firefighter on Rescue 1 at Station 1 and is in his 25th year in the Fire Department. He introduced the Asian Firefighters Association Executive Board that were in attendance which included Vice President Keith Onishi and Director Jonathan Honda. He acknowledged the members who were not in attendance, Treasurer Rick Hui, Secretary Chuey Kotake, Directors Rey Buzon, Brandon Tom and Mary Tse. He added that the Asian Firefighters Association is an employee group of the SF Fire Department and they are firefighters who want to be positive representatives of and for the Asian American community and that their mission is to create and maintain equality of opportunity for Asians and other minorities within the fire service throughout the city. He stated that they strive to be involved in constructive efforts and programs to maintain equitable hiring and promotional practices and are dedicated, along with other nonprofit organizations, to improve the quality of life for the minority members of the city. He touched on how the Consent Decree made the Department focus its recruitment and hiring of minorities and women. He mentioned that the Asian Firefighters Association continues to set up recruiting and fire safety booths at community events. He touched on events they have participated in over the years and stated that they currently have 415 members.

Chief Hayes-White acknowledged Firefighter Choy for stepping up into the role as the President of the Asian Firefighters Association and stated that since she's been with the Department, they have always been a real active part of the Department.

Commissioner Hardeman thanked them for their presentation and thought it was amazing that Firefighters Choy and Onishi have been at Station 1, which is very busy, for most of their careers. He also thanked them for not dwelling on the negatives and just talking about the positives.

Commissioner Covington thanked them for their presentation and stated that she was glad to hear more about the Asian Firefighters Association. She confirmed that you don't have to be a firefighter in order to join their association and that they have members from Oakland Fire and other counties. She mentioned that she was glad to hear about the success of their outreach in the community. Commissioner Covington confirmed that the Asian Firefighters Association donates \$50.00 to subsidize a portion of the tuition of any member who takes a class for a promotional opportunity. Commissioner Covington stated that she appreciated that he mentioned the Consent Decree because without acknowledgement of the Consent Decree leading to the wonderful department that we now have, we run the risk of going backwards. She mentioned that she has attended a number of the events that they have sponsored, and she's always had a marvelous time and has enjoyed meeting so many members of the Department and that she really appreciates Firefighter Choy's leadership.

Vice President Nakajo thanked Firefighter Choy and the board members who attended the meeting. He invited Firefighter Onishi and Honda to come to the podium to be recognized and to say a few words about the Asian Firefighters Association and their participation. Firefighter Honda explained that he was hired as an EMT working on ambulances out of station 49 and that during his tenure there, he had the privilege of working with Lt. Norm Caba, who was then the President of the Asian Firefighters Association and was extremely supportive and optimistic of having his Cox over to the Suppression side, which happened about six years ago. He added that the Asian Firefighters Association has been a critical role in his getting to where he is now and he would like to continue and reciprocate that mentorship process to say there is a flow path for people. Firefighter Onishi stated they try to encourage people to get involved with the Department and volunteer and be in the community. He added that he is involved with the Toy Program, the Cancer Prevention Foundation, and the Asian Firefighters Association. Vice President Nakajo added that one reason he went to the Asian Firefighters Association meeting was to get a message to the young guys about keeping it going. He was glad that the presentation included the history and Consent Decree and stated how important it was to hear that the Asian Firefighters Association is encouraging the firefighters to take various promotional exams.

President Cleaveland thanked Firefighter Choy for his leadership and confirmed that they do not work closely with the Black Firefighters Association in terms of the Youth Academy. President Cleaveland suggested that they work with the Black Firefighters Association to funnel youth that comes to them and wants a career in firefighting. He also confirmed that their dues are \$10.00 per month and that they are a nonprofit organization.

There was no public comment.

4 CHIEF OF DEPARTMENT'S REPORT *[Discussion]*

REPORT FROM CHIEF OF DEPARTMENT, JOANNE HAYES-WHITE

Report on current issues, activities and events within the Department since the Fire Commission meeting on August 22, 2018, including budget, academies, special events, communications and outreach to other government agencies and the public.

Chief Hayes-White reported on events since the last meeting on September 26, 2018. Regarding the budget, she announced that they are finalizing the close out of the last fiscal year and that everything looks good, and they are on track for this current fiscal year. In regards to academies and DOT activities, she stated that they recently promoted 21 H-3 Level 1 EMTs that had paramedic licenses to become H-3 Level 2 paramedics as well as two H-2 firefighters that had paramedic licenses were also part of that bump up academy and they became fully cross-trained within the Department to ascent to H-3 Level 3 Firefighter/Paramedics. She touched on the upcoming officers training, stating that it will have a very healthy curriculum and will entail a lot of work for the Division of Training. She added that they are on track for hiring 24 new employees, H-3 Level 1 EMTs on October 22, 2018, for a six-week academy as well as on track for the 125th academy with 54 members which is anticipated to start the end of January of 2019. She touched on recent events and activities during the reporting period, including Fleet Week, Hardly Strictly Bluegrass Festival, and the Italian Heritage Parade. She added that Chief Nicholson attended the memorial ceremony in Sacramento where they honored Firefighter Perry Choy and Battalion Chief Terry Smerdel. Chief Hayes-White stated that she, Assistant Deputy Chief Rivera and Deputy Chief Nicholson attended a meeting on an update on ESER projects, specifically Stations 5 and 15 which both have delays.

Chief Hayes-White announced that on October 3, 2018, Assistant Deputy Chief Michael Cochrane received an award for his service to San Francisco at the Irish, Israeli and Italian Society luncheon and she mentioned that she received the Brennan Award from the Saint Vincent De Paul Society, who does a lot of great work around homelessness, poverty, and domestic violence. She touched on other notable activities during the reporting period including the opportunity she got to fly in a naval helicopter over the city and Golden Gate and landed on the USS Bonhomme Richard and took that ship in under the Golden Gate Bridge where they had a great fireboat display.

Commissioner Hardeman commended Chief Cochrane on his recent recognition at the Triple I luncheon and was impressed with the speech of retired Chief Columbini describing the great attributes of Chief Cochrane. Commissioner Hardeman thanked the Chief for her report and notes how busy she is every month.

Commissioner Veronese stated he was sorry to have missed the Triple I luncheon. He also mentioned that he was at the Italian Heritage Parade and ran into many firefighters and paramedics along the route and congratulated Chief Cochrane, Chief Zanoft and the EMS Division as they did a great job at making sure that the people stayed safe. He asked if he could get a rough estimate as to how many people were in the city the weekend of October 6, with all the events that were taking place.

Vice President Nakajo confirmed that the 125th academy class is projected to start the latter part of January 2019 as well as the process that will take place in the next several months. He also congratulated Chief Cochrane and Chief Zanoft for their hard work during Fleet Week and other activities during the weekend of 10/5.

Commissioner Covington thanked Chief Hayes-White for her report and congratulated Chief Cochrane and Chief Zanoft for their great work over the Fleet Week weekend and added that she appreciates getting the briefings regarding the safety plan for large events. She asked Chief Hayes-White to share some of the things that she suggested for the webinar she participated in, where they covered topics such as “can’t we all just get along? How to stop bullying and promote positive firehouse behavior.” Chief Hayes-White responded that it was a discussion where four Fire Department Chiefs participated in a conference call for a Q and A and talked about how things have changed culturally as well as discussions on implementing proper policies to have everything transparent so that people have clear guidelines and expectations. She announced that the webinar can be found at <https://info.lexipol.com/webinar-fire-service-bullying>.

There was no public comment.

REPORT FROM OPERATIONS, DEPUTY CHIEF MARK GONZALES

Report on overall field operations, including greater alarm fires, Emergency Medical Services, Bureau of Fire Prevention & Investigation, and Airport Division.

Chief Gonzales reported on activities for the month of September. He mentioned that there were no greater alarms during the reporting period. He announced that call volume when up.

He touched on a few of the incidents that took place during the reporting period including a first alarm at 3331 Cabrillo, first alarm at 500 Fillmore, an adult male who was stranded on a rock and rescued at Glen Canyon and a bay rescue at Embarcadero South of an adult female. He touched on Fleet Week, non-identifiable home addresses and EMS-6. He mentioned that Prevention did 13 neighborhood outreach events in September.

Commissioner Covington asked Chief Gonzales to talk more about anything that can be done to keep people off the cliffs, as his reports have been replete with cliff rescues. Chief Gonzales stated that more signage and more barriers would be helpful. Commissioner Covington confirmed that the Department does not charge to rescue someone on a cliff, they only charge if the person is transported to a medical facility by ambulance. She asked for statistics on how many cliff rescues the Department has done this year, including dogs.

Commissioner Veronese stated that he would like to renew his request to recommend that the Mayor's Office create a task force with other agencies to deal with cliff and surf incidents in the hopes of persuading people to stay away from cliffs and dangerous surf. He also suggested sharing our very good data regarding non-identifiable address calls for service with the Homeless Department and the Mayor's Office especially when it comes to budgeting. There was discussion on the process for the posting of the Grant Writer Position, and the approval rate for the pre-application process for ADU's.

Commissioner Hardeman commented on the San Francisco Disaster Council meeting; the 216 bike medic responses at the Airport and the great work done by the Department over the busy Fleet Week weekend.

Vice President Nakajo thanked Chief Gonzales for his report and asked for some of the command force to speak about specific items in his report such as the data outlined on the EMS portion, fire complaints, plan check, and large community development projects. He confirmed that not only does the Department have an infrastructure responsibility within the departments and support services, but they also have an eye on the Fire Department relationship to every major project in San Francisco. He touched on the Airport Division, including the recent crash drill which went extremely well.

Commissioner Covington commented on the draft Grant Writer Position announcement and stated she was happy to see that the position is going to be posted but noted the very heavy concentration of the minimum qualifications on the person having professional level analytical work as opposed to the person having much experience on the grant writing side. Mr. Corso explained that the classification they are looking for has certain Civil Service minimum qualifications that are citywide regardless of whether the role is a financial analysis or grant administrator, but has a standard minimum qualification as there is not a designated classification for a grant writer specifically within the system.

There was no public comment.

6. COMMISSION REPORT *[Discussion]*

Report on Commission activities since last meeting on September 26, 2018.

There was no public comment.

7. AGENDA FOR NEXT AND FUTURE FIRE COMMISSION MEETINGS [Discussion]
Discussion regarding agenda for next and future Fire Commission meetings.

- Commission Retreat Action Items
- Peer Support Resolution
- MOU with the Guardians of the City
- Drone Policy update
- Update on Station 5 and 16 and update on location for a new training facility
- Cancer Prevention Foundation update
- Public Service Announcements thru SFGOV TV
- Strategic Plan update
- Chief's appraisal
- Amendments to the disciplinary process
- AB 3115 update
- 2019 meeting calendar

There was no public comment.

8. DEPARTMENT PHYSICIAN REQUEST FOR SECONDARY EMPLOYMENT

a. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE VOTE ON WHETHER TO APPROVE DEPARTMENT PHYSICIAN REQUEST FOR APPROVAL OF APPLICATION FOR SECONDARY EMPLOYMENT. [Discussion and possible action]

b. POSSIBLE CLOSED SESSION REGARDING PERSONNEL EVALUATION OF DEPARTMENT PHYSICIAN AS RELATED TO REQUEST FOR APPROVAL OF SECONDARY EMPLOYMENT. [Discussion]

Pursuant to Admin. Code section 67.10(b); Govt. Code section 54957(b), Govt. Code section 54957.1(a)(5), the Commission may hold a closed session to discuss the performance of Department Physician, Ramon Terrazas, insofar as it relates to his application for approval of secondary employment.

President Cleaveland explained that when you are accepting a second job and you currently work for the Fire Department, you are supposed to go through personnel and let them know that you have applied for secondary employment. In this case, Dr. Terrazas works for the Department under the supervision of the Commission and the Commission has to ascertain whether or not this new additional employment will interfere with his duties as a Department physician and Dr. Terrazas confirmed that the commitment that he undertook is not going to interfere with his duties as the Department Physician and will take place during off hours and he is committed to four hours a month. Commissioner Veronese confirmed that Dr. Terrazas would not have a problem giving the Department or the Fire Commission notice if the company that he will be performing work for is involved in litigation where his name might be brought into the proceedings and he would resubmit his request for this secondary employment on a yearly basis as required.

Further Questions and answers were conducted concerning the secondary employment.

Commissioner Covington moved to approve secondary employment. Commissioner Hardeman seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

There was no public comment.

9. PUBLIC COMMENT ON ITEM 10

Public comment on all matters pertaining to Items 10(b), (c), and (d) below, including public comment on whether to hold Items 10(b), (c) and (d) in closed session.

There was no public comment.

10. POSSIBLE CLOSED SESSION REGARDING PERSONNEL MATTERS AND EXISTING LITIGATION

a. VOTE ON WHETHER TO CONDUCT ITEMS 10(b), (c), and (d) IN CLOSED SESSION [Action]

The Commission may hear Item 10(b) and (c) in closed session pursuant to Government Code Section 54957(b) and Administrative Code Section 67.10(b).

The Commission may hear Item 10(d) regarding existing litigation in closed session if it votes to invoke the attorney-client privilege (Government Code § 54956.9; Administrative Code § 67.10(d))

Item 10(d) was tabled and continued to the November 14, 2018 meeting.

Commissioner Alioto-Veronese made a motion to conduct item 10(b), and (c) in Closed Session. Commissioner Covington seconded, and the motion was unanimously approved. (5-0; Cleaveland, Nakajo, Hardeman, Covington, Veronese)

The Commission went into closed session at 11:04 a.m.

Also present was Deputy City Attorney, Jennifer Stoughton, and Deputy City Attorney Brad Russi.

b. EMPLOYEE DISCIPLINE CASE NO. 2017-10: COMMISSION TO CONSIDER AND POSSIBLY TAKE ACTION ON A PROPOSED STIPULATED SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT CONCERNING MEMBER’S SUSPENSION APPEAL FILED ON DECEMBER 1, 2017, APPEALING A 10-DAY SUSPENSION FOR THE FOLLOWING ALLEGED RULE VIOLATIONS [Action item]:

- Section 1402 – Rules and Regulations
- Section 1803 – Maintenance
- Section 3905 – Familiarity with the Rules
- Section 3923 – Acts Detrimental to the Welfare of the Department
- Section 3939 – Loss or Damage of Tools or Equipment

c. EMPLOYEE DISCIPLINE CASE NO. 2017-11: COMMISSION TO CONSIDER AND POSSIBLY TAKE ACTION ON A PROPOSED STIPULATED SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT CONCERNING MEMBER’S SUSPENSION APPEAL FILED ON DECEMBER 1, 2017, APPEALING A 10-DAY SUSPENSION FOR THE FOLLOWING ALLEGED RULE VIOLATIONS [Action item]:

- Section 1402 – Rules and Regulations
- Section 1803 – Maintenance
- Section 3905 – Familiarity with the Rules
- Section 3923 – Acts Detrimental to the Welfare of the Department
- Section 3939 – Loss or Damage of Tools or Equipment

- d. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL – EXISTING LITIGATION.** Conference with legal counsel to discuss and possibly approve settlement of existing litigation pursuant to Government Code Section 54956.9(a), (c), (d), and Administrative Code Section 67.10(d)(1). *[Action item]*

Existing Litigation:

Chiles v. City and County of San Francisco

San Francisco Superior Court No.: CPF 17-515732

- 11. REPORT ON ANY ACTION TAKEN IN CLOSED SESSION** *[Discussion and possible action]* as specified in California Government Code Section 54957.1(a) and San Francisco Administrative Code section 67.12(b).

The Commission reconvened in Open Session at 11:27 a.m. President Cleaveland reported that the Commission unanimously agreed to approve the settlement agreements for Items Number 10(c) and 10(d).

- 12. VOTE TO ELECT WHETHER TO DISCLOSE ANY OR ALL DISCUSSIONS HELD IN CLOSED SESSION,** as specified in San Francisco Administrative Code Section 67.12(a). *[Action]*

Commissioner Covington Moved to not disclose discussions held in closed session. Commissioner Hardeman Seconded. The motion was unanimously approved. (5-0; Cleaveland, Nakajo, Hardeman, Covington, Veronese)

- 13. ADJOURNMENT**

President Cleaveland adjourned the meeting at 11:29 a.m.